Missouri University of Science and Technology
Scholars' Mine

Arts, Languages and Philosophy Faculty Research & Creative Works

Arts, Languages and Philosophy

01 Nov 2018

# Material for the Study of Food Terminology, Primarily from Barry Popik's Research, part 1

Gerald Leonard Cohen
*Missouri University of Science and Technology*, gcohen@mst.edu

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarsmine.mst.edu/artlan_phil_facwork

 Part of the English Language and Literature Commons

## Recommended Citation

Cohen, Gerald (compiler), (2018). Material for the Study of Food Terminology, Primarily from Barry Popik's Research, part 1. Comments on Etymology, Nov/Dec 2018, 48(2-3, double issue), pp. 1-84. Gerald Leonard Cohen.

This Article - Journal is brought to you for free and open access by Scholars' Mine. It has been accepted for inclusion in Arts, Languages and Philosophy Faculty Research & Creative Works by an authorized administrator of Scholars' Mine. This work is protected by U. S. Copyright Law. Unauthorized use including reproduction for redistribution requires the permission of the copyright holder. For more information, please contact scholarsmine@mst.edu.

COMMENTS ON ETYMOLOGY

November/December 2018 Vol. 48, no. 2-3
(double issue)

edited by Gerald Cohen
Department of Arts, Languages, and Philosophy
Missouri University of Science and Technology
(former name: University of Missouri-Rolla)
Rolla, Missouri 65409

Appears monthly October-May; Cost: $16 per year
(Libraries, Institutions: $20 per year)

CONTENTS

# MATERIAL FOR THE STUDY OF FOOD TERMINOLOGY, PRIMARILY FROM BARRY POPIK'S RESEARCH, part 1

Gerald Cohen (compiler)

Introduction.....2
1, BARRY POPIK: Slang *applesauce* (spoken dismissively) derives from a once popular but corny joke, possibly in a minstrel context.....3
2. BARRY POPIK: *Chicken à la King* (food and its name) likely derives from a Philadelphia cook named William King.....7
3. BARRY POPIK: *Chiffon Pie – NY Herald Tribune's* Clementine Paddleford explained (1939) it was invented in 1921 by Monroe Boston Strouse, whose mother provided the name by saying 'just like chiffon'.....13
4. BARRY POPIK: Chiffon cake (not pie) is invented about 1928 by Harry Baker in a Betty Crocker kitchen.....16
5. GERALD COHEN: *What am I, chopped liver?* – explanation from website 'Ask the Rabbi'.....17
6. GERALD COHEN: What does *cobbler* 'sort of pie' have to do with *cobbler* 'shoemaker'? .....19
7. BARRY POPIK: *Crepes suzette* – delightful but perhaps inaccurate story: Food was invented partially by accident by assistant waiter (later chef) Henri Charpentier; term was coined by the future King Edward VII of England.....22
GERALD COHEN: Wikipedia update casts doubt on Charpentier's claim.....23

8. BARRY POPIK: *Danish pastry*: its early history in the U.S. .....26
9. BARRY POPIK: *Eat crow*: Three versions of humorous story agree that Scotch snuff made the boiled crow particularly unappetizing.....44
10. BARRY POPIK: Origin of *hush puppies* (food).....48
11. GERALD COHEN and BARRY POPIK: 'Nail jelly to the wall,' spoken by Theodore Roosevelt, must have been a hilarious double-entendre to African-Americans.....50
12. BARRY POPIK: Origin of the *Margarita* (drink) is given in a 1974 article by Brad Cooper.....52
13. BARRY POPIK: *Slow as molasses* – a truncated expression.....54
14. BARRY POPIK: *Moscow mule* (alcoholic drink) – its two-stage development (pre-1947, with no ginger beer) and then 1947 onwards, with ginger beer and promoted by Smirnoff.....56
15. BARRY POPIK: *Oyster bar* and *oyster cocktail* .....59
16. BARRY POPIK: Pie-eating contest/match – did it originate in New York City? .....64
17. BARRY POPIK: The thin potato chip ('Saratoga potatoes'), was invented by an African-American – most likely Catherine Wicks; less likely her brother, George Crum.....67
18. BARRY POPIK: Origin of *thousand island dressing*.....74
19. SAM CLEMENTS: 1905 *Atlanta Constitution* article on ice cream cone: originated at St. Louis World's Fair and was now very popular at the Georgia State Fair.....77
20. GEORGE THOMPSON, GERALD COHEN (with valuable input from the IRISH STUDIES GROUP): Herring viewed by the Irish as a prosaic food.....82

## INTRODUCTION BY GERALD COHEN

For the past thirty years independent scholar Barry Popik has done extensive and extraordinary work on the English language. Of particular interest are his numerous items on food terminology, many still in working-paper form (*Comments on Etymology*) or entries on his website barrypopik.com.

It is time to compile and polish those items with the aim of having them appear in book form, and the present *COE* issue represents a first step towards that goal. Included also are a few items by other authors, since those items too are of interest.

# SLANG *APPLESAUCE* (SPOKEN DISMISSIVELY) DERIVES FROM A ONCE POPULAR BUT CORNY JOKE, POSSIBLY IN A MINSTREL CONTEXT[1]

Barry Popik

*HDAS* has *applesauce* from 1918, but without a hint of its origin—a gap that can now be filled. The expression derives from a once very popular but corny joke. Through overuse of the joke, the last word of the punch line (*applesauce)* came to refer to something trite and hence not to be taken seriously. Presented below are two examples of the applesauce joke that I located.

This corny applesauce joke was the 'Why did the chicken cross the road?' joke of its time, and I have found two examples of it:

## APPLESAUCE JOKE IN *THE GIRL FROM RECTOR'S*, 1927

This is from Rector (1927: 133-137):

### *'THAT APPLE-SAUCE JOKE*

'There is an expression sweeping America to-day which I heard Corse Payton use twenty-five years ago. Chauffeurs toss it at traffic policemen, traffic policemen catch it in mid-air and hurl it back, bad boys shout it at truant officers, and good little girls shrill it to their fond parents. Each granny tells it to grandpa and there isn't much doubt that grandpa has mumbled it to the manicurist in the barber shop. That expression is "apple sauce." You possibly have used it yourself without knowing how it originated. It started with Thatcher, Primrose, and West, who had one of the greatest minstrel organizations ever assembled. The expression "apple sauce" means anything that is old, trite, and out of date. This was the routine of the apple-sauce gag:

'THATCHER: Mr. Interlocutor, a teacher has twelve pupils and only eleven apples.
'WEST: Yes, Mr. Tambo, a teacher has twelve pupils and only eleven apples.
'THATCHER: That's right. Now she wants to give each pupil an equal share of the apples without cutting the apples. How does she do it?
'WEST: Let me see. A teacher has twelve pupils and only eleven apples. She wants to give each pupil an equal share of the apples without applying a knife to

[1]Reprinted from Popik 2018, which was developed gradually since 2000; details are given in the references.

the fruit. How does she do it? I must confess my ignorance. How does she do it, Mr. Tambo?
'THATCHER: She made apple sauce.'

'Thatcher used to get a huge laugh from this joke. Naturally, all the other rival minstrels grabbed it, used it, and finally hammered it into an early grave by too much repetition. Audiences refused to laugh at it any more and it was discarded. So any other joke which is old and no good is also called apple sauce. There is something about this expression which is very satisfying. When a motorcycle cop tells you that he is going to give you a ticket, not knowing that you are the mayor's friend, you tell him, "Apple sauce." When he hands you the ticket, you tell him, "Apple sauce." When you tell the judge you were going only two miles an hour, the judge hands down the verdict of, "Apple sauce." And when you fork over fifteen dollars and bounce out of the court room, the little birdies in the trees seem to be chirping it. I have never seen anything, outside of a sneak thief's skeleton key, which seemed to fit so many situations.

'In a previous chapter I spoke about the personnel of my restaurant—the cooks, the head chefs, the waiters, and the captains. There was one crew I forgot to mention, and this outfit was the band of nighthawks operating the fleet of scooped-out and sea-going hacks. The scooped-out hack was the open Victoria, while the sea-going vehicle was the closed hack, more like a brougham. Like Robin Hood's band, they were a merry bunch of outlaws who trimmed the rich—but failed to donate to the poor. There were fifteen or twenty outside of Rector's every night, rain or shine. Their scale of prices depended on their victim's condition of sobriety and knowledge of geography. Their tactics originated the famous "run-around." A man who is giving you the run-around is trying to stall you off by using evasive tactics.'

*OED* has "run-around" from 1915.

## WALTER WINCHELL'S 'APPLESAUCE' JOKE

The Walter Winchell 'applesauce' joke finally turned up in my paper search (for 'subway series'), so here goes.

From Walter Winchell 1928:
'*The Wisecrack and the Gag*
(From the October *Bookman*)
'When big time vaudeville was downtown or where Mr. Keith's Union Square Theater used to be in New York, no bill was complete without that pair who

swapped this one: "If you had eleven apples and twelve horses, how would you evenly divide the apples among the twelve horses?" To which the "straight man," or the comedian's partner, would respond: "I don't know, Ignatz. How would you evenly divide eleven apples among twelve horses?"

"Why, you simply make applesauce!" was the answer and if the auditors didn't fall right out of their chairs at that joke, then the next generation employed the tag line of the old reliable to squelch a braggart of an opinion with which they didn't concur.

'So great an army of entertainers employed the applesauce gag that it become the butt for derisive comment. It was in a class with "Who was that lady I seen you with last night?" or "Why does a chicken, etc.?" ...

"Applesauce!" said some one in the gathering and another wisecrack was born. The flapper incorporated it into her routine of sassy answers, the collegiate passed it along to his townsfellows via letters and even the smalltime and bigtime players "laughed off" a joke that failed to receive warm response from audiences by twitting themselves with "So we made apple-sauce" ...'

## (G. COHEN, 2018): ORIGIN OF 'THE RUN AROUND'

Notice the bonus which Popik found in Rector 1927 (quoted above, pp. 8-9), viz. besides the example of the applesauce joke, there is the suggested origin of 'the run around.'

## REFERENCES

Cohen, Gerald Leonard and Barry A. Popik 2006. Studies in Slang, vol. 7. Published privately by Gerald Cohen (University of Missouri-Rolla, since renamed Missouri University of Science & Technology). *Applesauce* article: pp. 112-114.

HDAS = Historical Dictionary of American Slang. (Editor: Jonathan Lighter). Vols. A-G (1994) and H-O (1997). NY: Random House. (Publication was supposed to continue with Oxford U. Press but has somehow stalled.)

Popik, Barry 2018. Slang *applesauce* (spoken dismissively) derives from a once popular but corny joke, possibly in a minstrel context. Comments on Etymology, vol. 47, no. 8. (May 2018), pp. 7-10. This item is part of a larger article compiled by Gerald Cohen ('Lexical items of African-American interest,' part 1), Comments on Etym., May 2018, pp. 7-88). The May 2018 item was slightly revised from Cohen and Popik (2006: 112-114), which in turn was reprinted from the working paper in Comments on Etymology, vol. 30, no. 5 (Feb. 2001, pp. 13-14). That working paper had been compiled and revised slightly from

several messages sent June 29ff. and Oct. 19, 2000 to the American Dialect Society (ads-l@listserv.uga.edu).

Rector, George 1927. The Girl From Rector's. Garden City, NY: Doubleday.

Winchell, Walter 1928. Your BROADWAY and Mine. Evening Graphic, April 21, 1928, p. 21.

# *CHICKEN À LA KING* (FOOD AND ITS NAME) LIKELY DERIVES FROM A PHILADELPHIA COOK NAMED WILLIAM KING[1]

Barry Popik

The origin of *chicken à la king* is currently unknown. Several suggestions have been made over the years, especially centering on Foxhall Keene, son of a famous Wall Street broker. But the suggestion that the food was originally christened 'chicken a la Keene' falters because nowhere is 'chicken a la Keene' attested as the name of the dish. Meanwhile, two plausible 1915 *NY Tribune* articles about the origin of *chicken à la king* have been overlooked, viz. that the inventor of the food was William King, a cook in Philadelphia. They certainly deserve consideration.

First, though, here is a sample of the current treatments:

1) From Stuart Berg Flexner's *Listening To America* (1982), pp. 142-143:
'*Chicken a la King* was introduced in the 1880s, one story being that it was suggested at Delmonico's restaurant by Foxhall Keene, son of the famous Wall Street operator and sportsman J. R. Keene, and served as *Chicken a la Keene* (another story says the dish was created at Claridge's in London for J. R. Keene himself).'

2) From Martha Barnette's *Ladyfingers & Nun's Tummies: A Lighthearted Look At How Foods Got Their Names* (1997), p. 98:
'Many culinary historians credit the Delmonico's menu with yet another addition to the gastronomic lexicon: one story has it that when Foxhall P. Keene, the well-heeled son of Wall Street broker James R. Keene, dreamed aloud to the Delmonico's chef about a dish of chicken in a pimento-studded cream sauce, the chef obliged and shrewdly named the result chicken a la Keene, an appellation that eventually evolved into the more regal-sounding chicken a la king.

3) From the *OED2* and *OED3*:
'*chicken a la King* (said to be named after E. Clark King, proprietor of a hotel in New York, cooked chicken breast served in a cream sauce with mushrooms and peppers.' [first attestation]:
1912 F.M. Farmer *New Book Cookery* 228 *Chicken a la King.'

[1]Combined and revised from Popik 1999, 2001, 2006.

4) Mariani (1999: 71-72): '*chicken à la king*. … Several theories as to the dish's origin date from the late nineteenth century. One credits New York's Brighton Beach Hotel, where chef George Greenwald supposedly made it for the proprietors, Mr. and Mrs. E. Clark King III. Chef Charles Ranhofer of Delmonico's Restaurant in New York City suggested that Foxhall P. Keene, son of Wall Street broker and sportsman James R. Keene, came up with the idea at Delmonico's in the 1880's. A third story credits James R. Keene himself as the namesake and the place and time of origin at Claridge's Restaurant in London after Keene's horse won the 1881 Grand Prix. However the dish got its name, first mentioned in print in 1912, it became a standard luncheon item in the decades that followed,…'

## CLARIFICATION IN TWO 1915 *NEW YORK TRIBUNE* ARTICLES

### Item #1: *NY Tribune*, March 5, 1915, p. 9, col. 5

'"CHICKEN A LA KING" INVENTOR DIES

'An Obscure Cook Made Famous by Compounding Well Known Dish

'Philadelphia, March 4. – A final tribute to the man who invented what is now the most famous bit of cookery in the world is being paid to-day by Philadelphia hotel men, who are collecting a purse for his widow and two small sons. The man whose culinary achievement the hotel men honor was William King. He died to-day at his home here.

"Chicken a la King" is the name of the dish that has entranced the world's epicureans, and, like all good things, it is simple. At the request of a waiter at the old Bellevue Hotel King compounded the dish one day twenty years ago. At that time he was an ordinary assistant cook in the kitchen of the hostelry that later was succeeded by the Bellevue-Stratford.

'A patron with a jaded palate had been grumbling, and the waiter asked King to prepare some dish that would please the man. King cut the white meat of chicken into small cubes. He added fresh mushrooms, cut in the same way, truffles, red and green peppers, and cooked the mixture in cream. The patron ate it lingeringly and lovingly, as one who knew that had met with a masterpiece, and then wanted to know who invented the dish.

"'Bill' King," said the waiter; "he works in the kitchen."

"Chicken a la King," said the patron; and so was the dish christened.'

Item #2: *NY Tribune*, March 7, 1915, part five (Sunday editorials), p. 8/1-2:

'*Chicken a la King.*

'The name of William King is not listed among the great ones of the earth. No monuments will ever be erected to his memory, for he was only a cook. Yet what a cook! In him blazed the fire of genius which, at the white heat of inspiration, drove him one day, in the old Bellevue, in Philadelphia, to combine bits of chicken, mushrooms, truffles, red and green peppers and cream in that delightsome mixture which ever after has been known as "Chicken a la King."

'That was many a year ago. Since then that toothsome morsel has pleased palates all round the world. King the man went the way of many another genius to his grave, and some of his old acquaintances have undertaken to look after his widow and children. Nevertheless, his work lives after him.

'To adopt the sentiments of a purveyor of good things who is also a philosopher, "For happiness of man he doeth more by far who maketh a new dish than he who finds a start!"'

ITEM IN *THE WASHINGTON POST* (FROM *PHILADELPHIA LEDGER*), March 14, 1915, p. M4

'*A NAME ON ALL MEN'S TONGUES.*
*(Philadelphia Ledger.)*

'The inventor of chicken a la King is dead. If Macadam is immortalized by a type of roadway, and Lord Raglan by a garment, and Sir Robert Peel by the "bobbies" and "peelers," why should not William King, of Philadelphia, go down to fame upon the palatable, savory concoction of fowl and muchrooms (sic), truffles and red peppers smothered in cream that wears his name?'

ITEM IN *THE RESTAURATEUR*, Feb. 27, 1926, p. 15

This 1926 item is reminiscent of the March 5, 1915 *NY Tribune* article presented above. *The Restaurateur* writes:

'Names of Cooks Seldom Given to "Master Dishes" and Chicken a la King was of Quaker City Origin'

'The outstanding American example of nominal glory to skilled cooks is William King, who was chef in the old Bellevue Hotel, in Philadelphia, about 1895. A dyspeptic customer, to whom food seemed tempting, requested the waiter one day to bring him something new. So inspired, King prepared bits of chicken, mushrooms, truffles, red and green peppers and cream. The dyspepsia victim ate heartily and demanded of the waiter who made the dish.

'Our chef, sir. William King," he was told.
"Oh, chicken a la king," remarked the customer.'

## ANTEDATING *OED3*'S 1912 FIRST ATTESTATION

*OED3*'s first attestation of *chicken a la king* is 1912 but here are several earlier ones:

1) 14 December 1893, *New York Times*, p. 3:
'The alumni of Princeton College gave a dinner to the football team to-night at the Princeton Inn. ... Among the dishes were the following: Green turtle a la Capitaine Trenchard, chicken a la King, tenderloin of "beef" a la Wheeler, diamond-back terrapin a la Balliet, plum pudding "holly" Lance.'

2) (from *Chronicling America*): 3 February 1905, *Washington* (DC) *Times*, p. 7, col. 1:
'One of the favorite luncheon dishes now being served is chicken a la king. It is delicious, and attractive to look upon as well. This is the way it is made: Cut into small dice the white meat of a cold roast chicken. Make a sauce poulette as follows: Put two tablespoonfuls of butter in a saucepan over the fire. When the butter melts stir in two heaping tablespoonfuls of flour which has been sifted twice. When the flour and butter are blended to a cream pour in slowly, and a little at a time, a pint of hot milk, stirring constantly to keep from lumping. Let the sauce just boil up once; then add a teaspoonful of grated onion, a saltspoonful of salt, and the yolks of two raw eggs. Stir them briskly through the sauce; then add two truffles and two mushrooms cut in small pieces and fried lightly in butter, one sweet green pepper cut in shreds and the seeds removed, and a generous tablespoonful of capers chopped rather fine, and just a suggestion of grated nutmeg. Last of all, add the cold chicken, stir the whole together, let it cook one minute, and serve on a deep platter garnished with diamond-shaped croutons.

3) 27 February 1905, *Baltimore* (MD) *Sun*, pg. 9:
SOME GOOD THINGS TO EAT.
'"*Chicken A La King*" *As It Is Served At The Waldorf.*
'One of the favorite luncheon dishes now being served in the Waldorf-Astoria is chicken a la king.

4) 24 December 1906, *Massillon* (Ohio) *Independent*, p. 2, col. 3:
*CHICKEN A LA KING.*
*Recipe From One of New York's Big Popular Hotels.*
'A favorite dish served in one of the big popular hotels of New York is chicken a la

king. The recipe, as given by the chef of the fashionable establishment, is as follows: Cut into small pieces the white meat of a cold roast chicken. Make a sauce with two tablespoonfuls of butter in a saucepan over the fire. When the butter melts stir in two heaping tablespoonfuls of flour which has been well sifted. When the flour and butter are mixed to a cream pour in slowly a pint of hot milk, stirring constantly to keep from lumping. Allow the sauce to boil up once, then add a teaspoonful of grated onion, a teaspoonful of salt and the yolks of two eggs. Stir them briskly through the sauce, add two truffles and two mushrooms cut in small pieces and fried lightly in butter, one sweet green pepper cut in shreds after seeds have been removed and a generous tablespoonful of capers chopped and just a suggestion of grated nutmeg. Last of all, add the chicken, stir all together and allow it to cook a minute. Chicken a la king is usually served in a chafing dish -- *New York Post*.'

5) 14 July 1911, Los Angeles *Times*, p. II5 ad:
'Minced Chicken a la King, 35c.'

6) 21 September 1911, Washington *Post*, p. 3 ad:
A good sherry to use to give the right flavor to lobster a la newberg, crab meat a la Maryland, and chicken a la king.
*TO-KALON WINE CO.*

## IMPORTANCE OF NEW YORK CITY

Even though chicken à la king most probably comes from William King of Philadelphia, there is no doubt that New York hotels helped popularize it. The dish was widely served there in the early 1900s.

## REFERENCES

ads-l = ads-l@listserv.uga.edu (American Dialect Society listserv)

Mariani, John F. 1999. The Encyclopedia of American food & Drink. NY: Lebhar-Friedman.

OED3: Oxford English Dictionary, 3rd (online) edition.

Popik, Barry 1999. *Chicken à la king* (food and its name) derives from a cook named William King. Comments on Etymology, Nov. 1999, vol. 29, no. 2, (Nov. 1999) pp. 2-4. Based on a June 22, 1999 ads-l message.

_____ 2001. Another item on *chicken a la king*. Comments on Etymology, Vol. 30, no. 5 (Feb. 2001), p. 18. Based on a Nov. 1, 2000 ads-l message.

_____2006 (June 25). *Chicken a la King*. website: barrypopik.com

*The Restaurateur*. This NYC weekly publication existed from 1923-1927 and then with a new name (*The Restaurateur And American Hotelier*) from 1927-1931. See Feb. 27 1926 item, p. 15/1-3: 'Names of cooks seldom given to "master dishes" and chicken a la King was of Quaker City origin.'

# *CHIFFON PIE – NY HERALD TRIBUNE'S* CLEMENTINE PADDLEFORD EXPLAINED (1939) IT WAS INVENTED IN 1921 BY MONROE BOSTON STROUSE, WHOSE MOTHER PROVIDED THE NAME BY SAYING 'JUST LIKE CHIFFON'[1]

Barry Popik

*OED*'s 'chiffon pie' entry seems similar to John Mariani's *Encyclopedia Of American Food & Drink* and Jean Anderson's *American Century Cookbook.* All state the earliest cite as a 1929 Beverly Hills cookbook, but the inventor is not identified.

From the *New York Herald Tribune*, 15 May 1939, p. 8, cols. 6-7:

(title): 'Its Inventor Tells How To Make A Chiffon Pie'
(subtitle): 'Reveals Secrets Of Crust And Filling And Offers 6 Recipes For Home Bakers'

by Clementine Paddleford

'It was a red-headed, modest boy named Monroe Boston Strause, of Los Angeles, who originated America's chiffon pies back in 1921. It was purely a crazy idea at that time, yet today chiffon pie is known to people in every walk of life and is the most talked of and highly published of all pies. Monroe Boston Strause is now America's No. 1 pie doctor, retained as a consultant by forty-eight bakeries in every part of the United States.

'He travels by air, dropping into client plants for observation—tasting, testing and demonstrating periodically. The "pie doctor" also supplies 108 bakeries with consultations by mail. Pie ailments are his specialties. He lectures, too, before groups of housewives and at schools of home economics, revealing baker's secrets practical for home use. He writes regular columns for four trade publications and has just published a book called "Pie Marches On."

'OVERDOES—His spectacular pie career amuses and amazes this friendly young man in his late thirties. He was the son of a farmer, reared on a California sugar beet ranch. He had no knack or interest then for cooking, but he had a good appetite. The dish he like best was served at a neighbor's table on the next farm. This neighbor family from Texas liked hot cornstarch pudding over hot biscuits. Monroe couldn't get enough of it until one day he got too much. That overeating proved a trifle which changed his destiny.

---

[1]Reprinted from *Comments on Etymology*, vol. 31, no. 1, Oct. 2001, pp. 16-18. (ed., G. Cohen): Popik first presented this article in an e-mail message to ads-l, Aug. 1, 2001.

'PIE TINKERER—At sixteen, with a little money saved, Monroe went into a partnership with his uncle Mike, a Los Angeles baker. It wasn't much of a bakery—not yet! Cream pies were the stock in trade—butterscotch, chocolate, banana cream. Monroe hated the very looks of these pies, for they reminded him of cornstarch pudding and they tasted much the same.

'Every spare moment the lad tinkered with pie fillings, set on their improvement. One day he got hold of a cookbook with a recipe for French cream, typical of the filling French chefs used in eclairs. Not a new idea, but new commercially. In this the egg whites were beaten, then a boiled sugar syrup added as for meringues and the cornstarch filling folded in. Monroe tried using the recipe for pie, by adding more egg whites, but the hot syrup toughened them. Next he beat up the whites and left the sugar out. A light spongy filling this time, but soft. By increasing the egg whites to four times the number used in the original French cream formula, a light filling resulted that stood up like a soldier on parade.

"Like chiffon," Monroe's mother said, surveying his creation—and that became its name. In a pie shell the chiffon filling was peaked high. The baker rounded it off dome fashion, making a pie high in the middle, a change in pie design.

'CRUMB CRUST – His mother was called into consultation again. The crust seemed thick for such a dainty substance. She suggested graham cracker crumbs for a pastry shell. Crumb crusts were then unknown. The first crumb mixture had too much shortening. It could not be rolled. When baked, it stuck to the pan. He had better luck next time, when he added corn syrup to the crumb and butter combination—about one tablespoon to a pie. He worked the mixture into a dough, then patted it over the pan, covering only the bottom, a pip shell without sides. Onto this, baked and cooked, the chiffon filling was poured then whipped cream added over all.

'Here was something brand new in pie technique, a sideless pie shell, of crumbs, a filling firm yet light as air, standing high in the middle and low at the sides. Proud of his masterpiece, he packed it up to show the chef of a leading Los Angeles restaurant.

'WONDER PIE -- The chef had French hysterics with excitement. It was a "tarte merveilleuse" – if only two flavors could be put in layers on one crust! Why not combine a chiffon French eggnog with chocolate chiffon? The chocolate made the bottom layer, the golden eggnog the next, whipped cream in a deep drift the top. One more touch the Frenchman demanded – curls of shaved chocolate over the cream.

'BLACK BOTTOM -- Now for a name. Cutting the pie revealed a black bottom, the new dance of the season. Thus it was that blackbottom pie took Los Angeles by storm. The chef ordered the creation as a novelty to sell at 35 cents a

slice. Within three weeks forty pies were served a day. Within three years Monroe boasted the second largest pie business on the west coast.

'DOCTOR'S ADVICE. – Yet the pie doctor didn't charge a cent for the two hours we took of his time borrowing advice and fool-proof chiffon pie recipes for readers of this column. He did deliver a scolding. Women pie bakers do one thing that makes him wild: They let the chiffon pie's filling cool before folding in the whipped egg whites. "Dead wrong!" he says. "Have the whites ready to go into the fillng the minute it comes from the flame. Then the heat cooks the eggs, imprisoning the air, and a fluffy texture results." For perfect chiffons follow the doctor's prescription. We borrowed six recipes he calls best from a collection of a hundred chiffons he has taught hotel chefs to make. Read each prescription three times, he advises, in giving these recipes. Lemon chiffon pie, he tells us, is the best all-year seller, but fresh strawberry pie leads in its season. He gives a recipe that may be used for each berry as it comes into season. The chiffoning of pineapple is comparatively simple, as his pie needs no refrigeration. In this the hot, cooked pineapple, coming in contact with the egg whites, gelatinizes the whites sufficiently to keep the filling firm. Crushed pineapple must be used; chunky pieces do not stay in suspension. Today's leaflet gives a recipe for orange chiffon, for cherry chiffon,. And the Strause way with the graham cracker crust which was a distinctive part of the original chiffon pie. Although other shells now are being used for chiffons, the Pie Doctor still prefers the graham cracker one. The only reason it isn't used more is that both professional pie men and home bakers have unhappy results because they have no proper recipe. The famous Strause recipe appearing in print the first time in his new book is given in today's leaflet "Pie King's Chiffons."'

## REFERENCE

ads-l = ads-l@listserv.uga.edu (American Dialect Society listserv).

# CHIFFON CAKE (NOT PIE) IS INVENTED ABOUT 1928 BY HARRY BAKER IN A BETTY CROCKER KITCHEN[1]

Barry Popik

From the *New York Herald Tribune*, 23 Feb. 1948, p. 10, col. 6:

'*12-Egg Cake With Only 7 Eggs Named Chiffon*
*First New Type To Appear In 100 Years Is Created in Betty Crocker Kitchen.*
By Clementine Paddleford

'A new cake is born, a new cake is christened—its name is chiffon. This is the first new cake type to appear in 100 years—now the cake kinds are three, the angel-sponge, the butter cake and the new sister with name borrowed from a pie.

'... A MAN'S IDEA – Twenty years ago in California Harry Baker, then forty-four, discovered a way to bake a light-flavorful cake that would stay moist longer than the usual kinds. The movie stars bought his cake direct from the kitchen and Hary [sic] Baker sold cakes to the Hollywood restaurants.

'Tired of cake making and ready to retire, Mr. Baker looked around for a medium through which to announce his recipe to the women of America. He thought of the Betty Crocker kitchen and last year visited the General Mills plant and sold his idea.'

## REFERENCE

ads-l = ads-l@listserv.uga.edu (American Dialect Society listserv).

---

[1]Reprinted from *Comments on Etymology*, vol. 31, no. 1, Oct. 2001, p. 19. (ed., G. Cohen): Popik first presented this article in an e-mail to ads-l, Aug. 20, 2001.

# *WHAT AM I, CHOPPED LIVER?* – EXPLANATION FROM WEBSITE 'ASK THE RABBI'[1]

Gerald Cohen

In early 2004 I sent several ads-l messages questioning the deprecatory reference to chopped liver in such expressions as 'What am I, chopped liver?' Well prepared chopped liver is always tasty, and very well prepared chopped liver is delicious, a culinary delight. Why the injustice of viewing it as anything less?

Several replies were sent, when I suddenly noticed that a plausible answer had already been given. An August 17, 2002 ads-l message from Rima McKinzey said:

'...Just got this from a friend...

'While we're on the subject of Yiddish, another expression whose origin people wonder about is, "What am I, chopped liver?"

'Consult an excellent website about all things Jewish, Ask the Rabbi. [See: https://ohr.edu/ask_db/ask_main.php/213/Q3/]

McKenzie then paraphrased the rabbi's reply, which I will now quote:

> 'As far as I know, the origins of the phrase are not Yiddish; I believe the phrase was originally coined in America. Being that chopped liver was always considered a side dish and not a main course, the phrase is used to express hurt and amazement when a person feels he has been overlooked and treated just like a "side dish".'

Incidentally, cf. *hors d'oeuvre*, literally 'outside of the (literary/artistic) work.'

## REFERENCES

ads-l = ads-l@listserv.uga.edu (American Dialect Society listserv).

HDAS = Historical Dictionary of American Slang. Editor: Jonathan E. Lighter. NY: Random House, 1993ff., vol. 1: A-G, vol. 2: H-O. Publication of this very valuable resource has somehow stalled. The *chopped liver* entry says:

1954 *Jimmy Durante Show* (CBS-TV): Now, that ain't chopped liver.

1983 *Family Feud* (ABC-TV) (May 6): Now this is not exactly chopped liver.

1983 *N.Y. Times Mag.* (Dec. 3) 102: That hurt me in the industry—and it ticked me off. I thought, "What was I chopped liver or something?"

1990 H.L. Gates, Jr. in *N.Y. Times Bk. Review* (Mar. 25) 37: The literary canon – now that ain't chopped liver.

[1]Revised slightly from *COE*, April 2004 (vol. 33, #7), pp. 22-23.

Landau, James A. 2001 Ads-l message 'Re: Chopped liver,' Aug. 9, 2002:
'I seem to recall that "what do you think I am, chopped liver?" was a Barbra Streisand line in the movie "Funny Girl." If so, that would be a source from which many people could have picked up the expression, particularly since the move had what amounted to a shtick in its portrayal of Fanny Brice as a preincarnation of Streisand…'

Wilson, Douglas G. 2001. Ads-l message 'Re: Chopped liver,' Aug. 9, 2002:
'"Chopped liver" means 'something cheap or trivial or something which can be ignored. It's been around since the 1930's, says Chapman's dictionary. *HDAS* shows an example from 1954. …I remember it from my childhood, usually in a context like "A million dollars? Now, that's not chopped liver!"…'

# WHAT DOES *COBBLER* 'SORT OF PIE' HAVE TO DO WITH *COBBLER* 'SHOEMAKER'?[1]

Gerald Cohen

The origin of *cobbler* (sort of pie) is unknown, and I have only a tentative guess of my own to advance. *OED* passes over the subject of the food's etymology in silence, while Barnhart 1988's very tentative suggestion is based on a word attested in 1385 but not in the mid-19th century, when *cobbler* (pie) originated:

> 'COBBLER #2: n. a kind of pie baked in a deep dish. 1859. American English, but perhaps ultimately related to, or even developed from unrecorded us of *cobeler*, n. 1385, a kind of wooden bowl or dish.'

Here now is *OED3*'s treatment:

> 'COBBLER, #4: 'A sort of pie, baked in a pot lined with dough of great thickness, upon which the fruit is placed; according to the fruit, it is an apple or a peach cobbler' *U.S.* '*Western*'. (Bartlett.)
> 1859 in BARTLETT *Dict. Amer.* 90
> 1880 'MARK TWAIN' *Tramp Abroad* xlix. 575, I have..made out a little bill of fare..as follows:..Peach cobbler, Southern style.
> 1946 *Farmhouse Fare* 130 October cobbler.1 quart blackberries... Place the berries..in a buttered pie-dish and sprinkle with lemon juice..roll out the paste to the size of the pie-dish. Place on top of the fruit.'

## POSSIBLE ANSWER: *COBBLER* MIGHT ORIGINALLY HAVE BEEN A DEROGATORY TERM

First, note another meaning of *cobbler* in *OED3*:

> COBBLER, #2: One who mends clumsily, a clumsy workman, a mere botcher.
> 1594 NASHE *Terrors of Night To Rdr.*, They would rather be Tailors to make, than botchers or coblers to amend or to marre.
> 1601 SHAKES. *Jul. C.* I. i. 11 Truely Sir, in respect of a fine Workman, I am but as you would say, a Cobler.
> 1681 W. ROBERTSON *Phraseol. Gen.* (1693) 342 A cobbler or botcher.
> 1791 BURNS *Wks. (Globe)* 495 Thou cobbler, botching the flimsy socks of bombast oratory.

---

[1]Revised slightly from *Comments on Etymology*, Oct./Nov. 2008, vol. 38, #1-2.

1811 BYRON Let. Dallas 21 Aug., He was beyond all the Bloomfields and Blacketts, and their collateral cobblers.

So, justly or unjustly the cobblers had a reputation as botchers, as clumsy workers. And now (1859) we see a pie named for them. At least here we would see some justification for the origin of name: The preparers of traditional pies might have looked askance at this newfangled 'sort of pie' (*OED*'s description) and referred to it derogatorily: that botched-up job, a pie prepared inartistically and clumsily, the sort of product one might expect from the quintessential botchers: the cobblers.

Incidentally, the reputation of cobblers as botchers evidently goes beyond English-speaking countries. I see online the following item:
http://www.friends-partners.org/oldfriends/literature/russian-proverbs.html

**Russian Proverbs and Sayings**

'This is a collection of Russian proverbs and sayings supplied from the book *A Book of English and Russian Proverbs and Sayings* by author M. Dubrovin, Moscow, "Prosveshcheniye", 1993.

#41. "There will be trouble if the cobbler starts making pies. (A person should concern himself with his own trade or occupation and should not engage in, or give advice about, other trades or occupations)"'

A LOOK AT *THE OXFORD ENCYCLOPEDIA OF FOOD AND DRINK*

For 'cobbler pie', Smith 2004 refers the reader to 'Pies and Tarts'. Here one finds (vol. 2, p. 272):

> '...Without the resources of brick ovens, or even the open-sided metal boxes known as Dutch ovens or tin kitchens, cooks often made cobblers—also called slumps or grunts—and their cousins, pandowdies, in pots over an open fire. ...'

This passage indicates that brick ovens, or at least 'Dutch ovens,' were required to do a high-quality job of pie-baking, and cobbler pies were of necessity a makeshift expedient. I'm not sure why cobbler pies could also be called 'slumps' or 'grunts,' but neither term bespeaks high admiration. All in all, it seems clear that at least some sophisticated pie makers must have regarded the new pie creation with disdain and found a derogatory term to refer to it: *cobbler* -- a bit like *Gothic* as an architectural term.

# REFERENCES

Barnhart, Robert K., 1988. The Barnhart Dictionary of Etymology. The Wilson Co.

Mariani, John F. The Encyclopedia of American Food & Drink. New York City: Lebhar-Friedman. – (silent on the origin of *cobbler pie*)

OED3 – Oxford English Dictionary. 3rd (online) edition.

Smith, Andrew F. 2004. The Oxford Encyclopedia of Food and Drink in America. 2 vols. Oxford U. Press.

# *CREPES SUZETTE* – DELIGHTFUL BUT PERHAPS INACCURATE STORY: FOOD WAS INVENTED PARTIALLY BY ACCIDENT BY ASSISTANT WAITER (LATER CHEF) HENRI CHARPENTIER; TERM WAS COINED BY THE FUTURE KING EDWARD VII OF ENGLAND

Barry Popik

*OED* has 1907 ('Suzette') with a note that the 'crepes suzette' originator (cited below) died at age 81 in 1961. Was the 'crepes suzette' created in 1894-95?

From the *Bar & Grill Journal,* July 1938, p. 21, col. 2:
'*Famous Chef Recalls Birth of Crepes Suzette.*

'"When I was but 14 years of age," writes Henri Charpentier of 'original Henri,' 666 Scranton Avenue, Lynbrook, L.I., "I had the honor and pleasure of creating a dish for His Highness, Edward, Prince of Wales, later Edward VII King of England.

"It was the Café de Paris in Monte Carlo where, through a series of fortunate circumstances, this great honor was bestowed upon me, an assistant waiter.

"My creation was completed. It was to be a rare tasting pancake made with Suzette butter, and served with a cordial sauce, principally cointreau. I was working in front of a chafing dish when, quite by accident, the cordial caught fire. I was mortified to think of delaying the Prince.

"In my dilemma, I tasted the sauce. To my astonishment, I found it the most delicious melody of sweet flavors I had ever tasted. That accident of the flame was precisely what was needed to bring all of the ingredients into one harmony of taste. I plunged my supply of folded pancakes into the boiling sauce. I submerged them and turned each pancake deftly.

"The Prince ate the dish with obvious enjoyment, using a spoon to capture the remaining syrup. He christened my creation Crepes Suzette.

"In the last forty years I have served this dish to celebrities the world over among whom were Sarah Bernhardt, Mashal Jeffre, Diamond Jim Brady, and a host of others. The formula has been slightly changed but the principal flavoring ingredient is still cointreau."'

---

[1]Revised from Popik 2000, which in turn was taken from a July 8, 2000 message of Popik's to ads-l. These earlier versions simply presented Charpentier's story, albeit with Popik's question whether 'crepes suzette' was created in 1894-1895.

## REFERENCES

ads-l = ads-l@slistserv.uga.edu (American Dialect Society listserv)
Popik, Barry 2000. *Crepes suzette* – food was invented partially by accident by assistant waiter later chef) Henri Charpentier, and the term was coined by the future king Edward VII of England. Comments on Etymology, Oct. 2000 (vol. 30, no. 1), pp. 2-3

* * *

## WIKIPEDIA UPDATE CASTS DOUBT ON CHARPENTIER'S CLAIM

Gerald Cohen

Perhaps it didn't happen exactly as Charpentier portrayed. Here is Wikipedia's presentation (July 1, 2018; https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Cr%C3%AApes_Suzette )

'**Crêpes Suzette** (pronounced [kʁɛp syˈzɛt]) is a French dessert consisting of a crêpe with *beurre Suzette* (pronounced [bœʁ syzɛt]), a sauce of caramelized sugar and butter, tangerine or orange juice, zest, and Grand Marnier, triple sec or orange Curaçao liqueur on top, prepared in a tableside performance, flambé.[1]

'**Origins**

'The origin of the dish and its name is disputed. One claim is that it was created from a mistake made by a fourteen-year-old assistant waiter Henri Charpentier in 1895 at the Maitre at Monte Carlo's Café de Paris. He was preparing a dessert for the Prince of Wales, the future King Edward VII of the United Kingdom, whose guests included a beautiful French girl named Suzette. This story was told by Charpentier himself in *Life à la Henri*, his autobiography,[2] although later contradicted by the *Larousse Gastronomique*.

'It was quite by accident as I worked in front of a chafing dish that the cordials caught fire. I thought it was ruined. The Prince and his friends were waiting. How could I begin all over? I tasted it. It was, I thought, the most delicious medley of sweet flavors I had ever tasted. I still think so. That accident of the flame was precisely what was needed to bring all those various instruments into one harmony of taste . . . He ate the pancakes with a fork; but he used a spoon to capture the remaining syrup. He asked me the name of that which he had eaten with so much

relish. I told him it was to be called Crêpes Princesse. He recognized that the pancake controlled the gender and that this was a compliment designed for him; but he protested with mock ferocity that there was a lady present. She was alert and rose to her feet and holding her little skirt wide with her hands she made him a curtsey. 'Will you,' said His Majesty, "change Crêpes Princesse to Crêpes Suzette?" Thus was born and baptized this confection, one taste of which, I really believe, would reform a cannibal into a civilized gentleman. The next day I received a present from the Prince, a jeweled ring, a panama hat and a cane.

'Different sources (like the *Larousse Gastronomique*) however doubt that Charpentier, rather than the head waiter, was serving the prince, because he would have been too young.[1] A less fantastical version emerges from Elsie Lee's interview with him in the 1950s. There, Charpentier explained at length that *his complicated version began as the dish of pancakes with fruit sauce his foster mother made on very special occasions.*[3] The addition of liqueur was *au courant* among chefs in Paris at the time.[3]

'The other claim states that the dish was named in honour of French actress **Suzanne Reichenberg** (1853–1924),[4] who worked professionally under the name Suzette. In 1897, Reichenberg appeared in the Comédie Française in the role of a maid, during which she served crêpes on stage. Monsieur Joseph, owner of Restaurant Marivaux, provided the crêpes. He decided to flambé the thin pancakes to attract the audience's attention and keep the food warm for the actors consuming them. Joseph was subsequently director of the Paillard Restaurant in Paris and was later with the Savoy Hotel in London.

'In 1896, Oscar Tschirky published the recipe as "Pancakes, Casino Style" with everything in place except the final flambée.[5] Escoffier described *Crêpes Suzette* in the English version of his *Guide Culinaire* in 1907 (French 1903) the same way, also without the final flambée.

The dish was already a specialty of the French restaurant Marie's by 1898.[6]

**REFERENCES**

1. Courtine, Robert J. (1984), *Larousse gastronomique* (French edition), Paris: Librairie Larousse.
2. Charpentier, Henri & Sparkes, Boyden (2001), *Life À La Henri - Being The Memories of Henri Charpentier*, New York: The Modern Library, Paperback Edition. Originally published by Simon & Schuster, Inc., 1934.
3. Lepard, Dan *(6 July 2007). "How to Bake Crêpes Suzette Tour d'Argent". The Guardian. p. 61.* Archived from the original on 27 October 2014.'

4. *Claiborne, Craig* (1994) *Craig Claiborne's The New York Times Food Encyclopedia*, Random House Value Publishing.
5. Oscar Tschirky, *The Cook Book by "Oscar" of the Waldorf*, p. 629
6. L. Daudet, *Paris Vécu*, 1929, p. 85

# *DANISH PASTRY*: ITS EARLY HISTORY IN THE U.S[1].

Barry Popik

## VEHLING 1950 CHALLENGES KLITTENG'S REPUTATION AS INVENTOR OF DANISH PASTRIES; SAYS THEY WERE NOT EVEN A UNIQUE FEATURE OF DENMARK

Upon reading through numerous U.S. popular accounts about the origin of Danish pastry one might readily accept that L. C. Klitteng invented it. He certainly helped popularize Danish pastry in the U.S. and perhaps even introduced it here (all praise!), but note Joseph Vehling's iconoclastic comments (1950: 266; see last two sentences) in obvious reference to Klitteng:

> 'In 1917-18 the newspapers and the menus of the nation were full of "Danish Pastry." Due to the activities of a picturesque, hitchhiking peripatetic baker from Copenhagen, who on a tour of the world, gave guest performances in many American cities, demonstrating his art, obtaining testimonials from officials, giving interviews, accumulating huge scrap books of clippings. He baked the wedding cake for President Wilson's wedding in Washington. His methods (demonstrated before this writer) were those of any first class continental baker, nothing new or spectacular nor particularly "Danish." His "Danish Pastry" had been practiced for ages in continental Europe which he admitted.'

## *OED3* HAS 1934 AS THE FIRST ATTESTATION, BUT EARLIER ONES CAN BE FOUND.

*OED3* has 1934 as the earliest attestation for 'Danish Pastry,' but here are various antedatings:

1) 13 October 1914, Fresno (CA) *Morning Republican*, p. 9 ad:
'*Danish Pastry*
'Our Danish Pastry is noted for an interesting variety of tit-bits. Better try some.
... *GRAFF'S KERN STREET STORE*'

[1]Combined and revised from Popik 2001 and 2004. Popik 2001 was based on messages he sent to ads-l, Aug./Oct./Nov. 2000, together with a few replies by other ads-l members. In 2001 Popik and Cohen thought that the earliest attestations appeared in 1920, but by 2004 Popik had found still earlier ones.

2) 29 October 1916, *Fresno* (CA) *Bee*, p. 8 ad:
'*Serve our Dainty French and Danish Pastries*
'To your friends; they're always appreciated and win favors wherever served.'

3) 9 August 1917, Oakland (CA), *Oakland Tribune*, p. 6:
'*NEW PASTRY TO*
*RIVAL FRANCE'S*
*ART CONFECTION*

'The horseshoes, crescents, varnished strawberries, marshmallow Ostermoors, and wholly delectable French pastry effects which have formed the piece de resistance of a perfect culinary mobilization, are to have a rival, in the form of Danish pastry [illegible or missing text for about five words – B. Popik] the French variety look like Verdun after a battle.

'The Danish confections are the product of L. C. Klitteng, globe-trotter, patisserie savant, and purveyor of goodies to the wedding of President Wilson in December, 1915, who is to-day introducing his products to local baking houses, and teaching local pastry cooks the method in an effort to create a taste for the Danish variety. he has touched Sweden, Finland, Austria, Switzerland, Russia, the West Indies and France in his world itinerary, and from Oakland will go to Honolulu and the Orient.'

'There is a difference between the Danish pastry and the French. The French pastry is eaten daintily and slowly, allowing each new discovery to sink in, and the flavors to blend one by one, until the effect of the whole is an Arabian dream of gastronomic thoughts. But with the Danish pastry -- you just tuck a small morsel under the tongue, roll up the eyes, say "Ah-h" as though there were a sky-rocket present, and it fades away and trickles down to the barbed-wire entanglements of the soul, a subtle something that clings like an opium eater's dream.

'In other words, Danish pastry is said to be good eating.'

4) 9 February 1919, Galveston (T) *Daily News*, p. 5 ad:
'*DANISH PASTRY*
'This is to announce to the public of Galveston
that we have engaged the world-famed baker
MR. L. C. KLITTENG
Of Isle of Laesoe, Denmark.
To Introduce the Celebrated Danish pastry
in Our Bakery from Saturday, Feb. 8

'*DANISH PASTRY*
'Fresh From the Oven at 11 a. m. and 4 p. m. Today

'Mr. Klitteng made and served
this kind of Danish Pastry for
President Wilson's wedding in
Washington, Dec. 1915, and
since that time has introduced
same all over from New York
to San Francisco.

'We cordially invite you to try out this
most excellent of all kinds of cakes for
your coffee and tea.

*Schaefer's Bakery*
2102 Market St.

5) 5 March 1919, Galveston (TX) *Daily News*, p. 7 ad:
Have Your Tried the Celebrated
DANISH PASTRY?
(...)
'The popularity of Danish Pastry is growing.
(...)
*Schaefer's Bakery and Delicatessen*

6) 26 September 1919, *Atlanta Constitution*, "Bits of New York Life" by O. O. McIntyre, p. 8:
'Another Danish pastry shop.'

7) 27 September 1919, *Atlanta Constitution*, "Bits of New York Life" by O. O. McIntyre, p. 8:
'Meredith Nicholson, the Indiana novelist, was lunching with Ray Long, editor of the Cosmopolitan, in one of those flossy Danish pastry places that suddenly bloomed in the Forties the other day.'

8) 2 December 1919, *New York Times*, p. 4:
'The complaint further alleges that at present there are restaurants, masking as French and Danish pastry shops, which will in a very short time be selling liquors.'

9) 24 April 1920, *Bakers Weekly*, p. 17 presents a full page ad for 'Danish Pastry Baking School.' A photo shows:
'Instructor L.C. Klitteng, Originator of Danish Pastry In U.S.A'

10) 1 May 1920, *Bakers' Helper*, p. 885, col. 1, recipe for 'Danish Pastry Dough,' by Paul Richards.

11) 15 May 1920, *Bakers' Helper*, p. 978, col. 2 headline:
'SWEDISH, DANISH OR FRENCH PASTRIES' [Recipes follow.]

12)1 June 1920, *Bakers' Helper*, p. 1029 full page ad:
'The Man Who Made DANISH PASTRY Famous
Klitteng's DANISH PASTRY SCHOOL New York...Opens July 1st.'
(B. Popik: Full photo of him in chef's garb is photocopied below.)

13) 1 June 1920 *Bakers' Helper*, p. 1090, col. 1:
'*Danish Pastry School Starts July 1st.*

'The Danish Culinary Studio, 146 Fifth avenue, New York City, is scheduled to open July 1st, and applicants are being enrolled for the first course. The school has been founded by L.C. Klitteng, who came to this country from Denmark in December, 1915, and has been responsible for most of the popularity which Danish pastry has acquired here. Shortly after his arrival he made his choice dainties for the President's wedding.[1] His next association was with Gertner's in New York City, where he instructed the bakers fully in this line. In his extensive travels since, covering [col. 2] thirty states, he has baked in most of the leading cities, in some of the best bakeries and pastry shops.

'In the wake of his success sprang up many imitations to meet the new demand, and inferior goods were put upon the market and sold at the prices which the genuine products properly command. [Then: more about the school]'

14) 21 October 1921 *American Cookery*; p. 197 contains a long recipe, which begins: '*Danish Pastry*
'Rinse a bowl and a wooden spoon in hot water, then in cold, letting cold water, changed once or twice, stand in the bowl until the bowl is chilled. ...'

Also, on p. 198 there are two photos with the recipe:
'DANISH PASTRY (SET TO RISE)' and
'DANISH PASTRY (COOKED)'

15) 7 April 1923. *The Restaurateur*[2], p. 8, col. 1:
*'Introduced Danish Pastry to New York.*
*Herman Gertner Is The Man Who More Than Any Other Is Responsible For The Great Vogue of Pastry In America.* (...)

---

[1]That would be Woodrow Wilson, first married in 1885 (to Ellen Louise Axson, d. Aug. 6, 1914) and then Dec. 18, 1915 to Edith Bolling.

[2]*The Restaurateur* was a NYC weekly publication which existed from 1923-1927 and then (as *The Restaurateur And American Hotelier*) from 1927-1931.

'The genesis of his growth is that "every man deserves a chance." This led to his discovery of the chef who introduced Mr. Gertner to Danish pastry and which led to Gertner's introducing Danish pastry to Broadway, New York, and permanent stock engagements in the West.'

16) 1926 – Cookbook: *Cakes For Bakers* (3rd ed., Bakers' Helper Company, Chicago, Ill) by Paul Richards says:
'Danish Pastries, 200, 218, 388, 390' and
'Danish Pastry Dough...201.'

17) 1926 – *Every Woman's Cook Book*, by Mrs. Chas. F. Moritz has:
'Danish Pastries, 469'

18) 26 Feb. 1926, *The Restaurateur*, p. 2 full page ad; ran weekly for a long time:
'Profits from DENMARK!
'*Danish Pastry* opens up to you a new field for profitable sales.'[1]

19) 23 March 1926, *The Restaurateur*, p. 11, col. 1:
'Research Bakery Gives Recipe
Procter & Gamble Company Through
Experiments Tell How To Make A
Better Danish Pastry.

20) Joanne Despres, now Senior Editor of Merriam-Webster, clarified in an 8/1/2000 ads-l message that 'The evidence for our (1928) *Collegiate* date is a trial definition date 12/21/28. It reads:
'"Danish pastry. n. A rich pastry based on a yeast dough with the fat mixed as in puff paste."'[2]
Presumably this is the 1928 date referred to by Mariani 1999; see the references at the end of this article for his quote.

---

[1]This ad was for Procter & Gamble product Crisco.

[2]The second part of Despres' message says: 'I see that a later citation taken from *America's Table* (1950) by Joseph D. Vehling contains the statement:
"In 1917-18 the newspapers and the menus of the nation were full of 'Danish Pastry,' due to the activities of a picturesque, hitchhiking peripatetic baker from Copenhagen who... [text ends at this point]."'
Vehling does not specify who that baker was, but it must have been Klitteng. He is the one who was frequently described as 'peripatetic,' and cf. item #3 above (9 Aug. 1917) which says:
'The Danish confections are the product of L. C. Klitteng, globe-trotter, patisserie savant, and purveyor of goodies to the wedding of President Wilson

21) From *The Nation's Chefs*, Dec. 1929, p. 46, col. 1:

'*Danish Pastry*. As Demonstrated By Christian Sorensen [then article:]

'(Mr. Sorensen kindly posed for these photographs at his place of business, the Terminus Restaurant, Chicago. Photos by J. D. Vehling.)

'Christian Sorensen is a good baker. What's more, he originally comes from Copenhagen, Denmark, where he learned his trade. Putting two and two together, we reasoned that he must know something about [col. 2] Danish Pastry. We were correct. As we like to go to authentic sources for our information, we went to him to tell us all about Danish Pastry, taking the cameras along.

'The dough for Danish Pastry is similar in treatment to puff paste. You take a good stiff yeast dough, but take less butter than for puff paste, and roll it in only three times three. Let the dough repose some time between the intervals, then roll it out, as shown in the illustration.

'Otherwise the treatment is much the same as in the case of ordinary sweet rolls.'

THE FIRST ATTESTATION OF 'DANISH PASTRY' COMES IN 1914, BUT IN EARLY COOKBOOKS (PRIOR TO 1926) 'DANISH PASTRY' IS CONSPICUOUS BY ITS ABSENCE.

'Danish pastry' is first attested in 1914, and thus far the two earliest cookbook attestations I located for the term appear in 1926 as 'Danish Pastries.' Even two 1928 cookbooks which might have been expected to include it don't do so. Perhaps the term and food were still too new in the mid-1920s to be considered suitable for inclusion in a cookbook of standard items.

My list below includes two pre-1914 cookbooks to help underscore that 'Danish pastry' was not yet in common parlance, or likely even in existence.
*NY Herald Tribune* food writer Clementine Paddleford once wrote (20 April 1946, p. 26/6): 'The first Danish pastry to win name and fame in New York City back in the 1890's...' That date is too early by some 20 years.

1) 1907 – *The Book Of Priceless Recipes* by the Hahnemann Hospital (Philadelphia, PA) has 'Cheese Pastry,' 'German Doughnuts,' and 'German Waffles,' but no 'Danish Pastry.'

---

[continued from fn. #2 on p. 30] in December, 1915...'
A slight discrepancy is that Kletting came from Læsø (not Copenhagen) Denmark. Baker Christian Sorensen was from Copenhagen, and Vehling had at least some direct familiarity with him. But everything else argues for Klitteng being the one referred to in Vehling's comment, and the best interpretation seems to be that Vehling's memory was faulty on Klitteng's origin.

An extensive 'Pastry' heading in this 1907 cookbook has: 'Cheese Cake; Cocoanut Pie; Cream Pies; Custard Pie; Florida Lemon Pie; Lemon Cheese Cake; Hattie's Lemon Custard; Lemon Meringue; Lemon Meringue Pie; Lemon Pie; Linden Hall Seminary Taffy Pies; Maryland Lemon Pies; Superfine Mince Meat; Mince Meat; Mince Pie; Molasses Lemon Pie; Pumpkin Pie; Raisin Pie; temperance Meat Pie.'

2) 1908 – *Lowney's Cook Book* by Maria Willett Howard has 'Danish Pudding' and 'Pastry,' but no 'Danish Pastry.'
3) 1915 – *The Something's Different Dish* by Marion Harris Neal has everything from 'Bubble and Squeak' to 'Faggots,' but no 'Danish Pastry.'
4) 1916 – *Mary Jane's Cook Book* has only 'Pastry, Turkish cream.'
5) 1918 – *Conservation Recipes* by Mobilized Organizations of Berkeley, CA. has no 'Danish Pastry' in its extensive pastry list.
6) 1918 – Desserts And Salads by Gesine Lemcke has 'Denmark Cake,' but no 'Danish Pastry.'
7) 1918(?) – *Cook Book Of The Junior Board Of The Woman's Hospital Association* (Cleveland, Ohio; founded 1913) has 'Zweiback Pastry' and 'Sailor Duff' on p. 111, but no 'Danish Pastry.'
8) 1925 – *Everybody's Cook Book* by Isabel Ely Lord has 'English Pastry' and 'French Pastry,' but not 'Danish Pastry.'
9) *The Home Makers' Cooking School Cook Book* (Chicago Ill) by Jessie M. DeBoth has 'Pastry: Almond, Plain Rich, Puff, Venison.'
10) 1928—*The Modern Cook Book* by K. Camille Den Dooven has a large dessert section, but a 'French Pastry' heading only.
11) 1928 – *The Blue Gingham Cook Book* by Imogene B. Woolcott has 'Danish Apple Cake' and 'Danish Sour Pickles.'

## JOURNALIST FOOD-WRITER CLEMENTINE PADDLEFORD, 1946, WRITES ABOUT 'DANISH PASTRY'

The following item may be of interest, but Caveat lector! I cannot vouch for its authenticity on every point.

30 April 1946, *New York Herald Tribune*, p. 26, col. 6:
'*Frozen Danish Pastry Dough Aids Home Cooks*
'*Take From Refrigerator,*
*Then Thaw and Bake Are*
*Simple Rules for a Treat*
by Clementine Paddleford

'The first Danish pastry to win name and fame in New York City back in the 1890's[1] has gone ultra modern and sells in frozen dough form, ready for the home oven.

'Two products in the line, one the individual pastries mentioned a few weeks ago, the other a twist that's new as this week, called "Almond Delight." Both items are made of the same basic dough formula, the one Herman Gertner bought from Lane L. M. Kleiting[2] back at the turn of the century.

'This Kleiting fellow blew into the Gertner's restaurant one autumn day, recipe in hand and offered it for sale with a long list of fancy fillings. He stayed around long enough to teach the pastry chef the way of its making and how to turn it out in sticks, envelopes, turnovers, twists. Four months after the Danish breads went on the menu they were the talk of the town. The smart thing after the theater was to drop into Gertner's at 1440 Broadway for coffee and pastries.

'Herman Gertner had been manager of the old Astor before he branched out for himself in 1890, opening his first little restaurant on lower Broadway, then the restaurant uptown, then a third at 711 Seventh Avenue. A restaurant chain was his plan; Danish pastries changed his mind. He decided to hire extra bakers and sell the breads wholesale. His sweetbread business went soaring until 1939, when Herman retired and returned his famous recipe to the safe box at the bank.

SEVERAL ITEMS IN *THE NATIONAL BAKER*, 1920, PRESENT PERIPATETIC DANISH BAKER L.C. KLITTENG AS INVENTOR OF DANISH PASTRY IN THE U.S.

'Danish Pastry' is in *The National Baker* (Philadelphia, PA) several times in 1920.

ITEM #1: *THE NATIONAL BAKER*, JULY 1920, page 5, full page ad:

'*Danish Pastry*
'The Last Word In Fancy Cakes for the Coming Winter Season
'*Learn It Now—and Learn it Right*

'The name of L.C. Klitteng[3] is known all over the United States in combination with his work as instructor in making Danish Pastry. It will therefore, we suppose,

---

[1]Not the 1890's; first attestation is 1914.

[2]sic; 'Lane L. M. Kleiting' must be an error for *L. C. Klitteng*, the name that appears in Klitteng's ads in baking periodicals. Also, a check of the internet shows his first initial stands for 'Lauritz.'

[3]Not in *NY Times Personal Name Index*, not in *Reader's Guide* for these years, and not on OCLC World Cat.

be of great interest to see and read some of the endorsements which Mr. Klitteng has received from prominent men of the trade, testifying to the success of his methods and how his Danish Pastry has brought large profits.

'What They Say

'Below will be found extracts of letters from those who have tried Danish Pastry as a commercial product. These are but a few of the many testimonials on file in our office...[1]

DANISH CULINARY STUDIO
146 Fifth Ave. New York'

ITEM #2: *THE NATIONAL BAKER*, JULY 1920, page 12, col. 1:

'*School for Danish Pastry*,

'L.C. KLITTENG, the authority on Danish Pastry, which he originated in the United States, and which has become so deservedly popular wherever introduced, announces that he has established his Danish Culinary Studio at No. 146 Fifth Avenue, New York City, and that students will be thoroughly instructed in this art of producing high grade pastry, either by practical demonstration or through a correspondence course.

'Mr. Klitteng has introduced Danish Pastry in many countries and in numerous cities in this country, and has many convincing testimonials as to the large sales and profits made by those who have made know this delicious pastry to their local trade.

'As it is not possible for Mr. Klitteng to personally visit each baker who is interested in producing Danish Pastry, he decided to establish a school where he could give practical instruction in a course covering fourteen days...

'See the announcement on another page and write for booklet and full particulars.'

ITEM #3: *THE NATIONAL BAKER*, AUGUST 20, 1920, p. 56, col. 1:

[B. Popik: Two column photo of: 'DANISH PASTRY MADE AFTER RECIPE BY L.C. KLITTENG, ISLE OF LESO [LÆSØ], DENMARK.'
Caption: 'Bakery Salesroom of John Seybold, Miami, Florida, With Display of Danish Pastry, as Arranged by L.C. Klitteng.']

'*Danish Culinary Studio*

'The Danish Culinary Studio has received inquiries from all over the United States, Main [sic] to California, inclusive, from both men and women,

---

[1]See full page reproduced below, p. 40; John Seybold of Miami writes: 'I engaged Mr. L.C. Klitteng, consulting baker of the Isle of Laesoe, Denmark...'

masterbakers and employees—even as far away as the British West Indies the inquiries come. An entirely new class of people being attracted by the superior qualities of Danish Pastry are the heads of the Department of Economics and lecturers on scientific food preparation of the great universities and other institutions maintaining similar departments…

[col. 2] 'Attention is called to '*Klitteng's Success Book*,' now in preparation, in which is revealed for the first time some of the secrets of the phenomenal rise of L. C. Klitteng to the position of the world's highest paid baker.[1] Every man, whether a baker or not, will find inspiration in reading the exposition of the laws of success as applied by the man who is one of the most unique and interesting characters in "the world of dough," and who has met and conquered many difficulties —and hopes to meet an conquer many more.'

*PAUL RICHARD'S* [sic] *PASTRY BOOK,* 1907, DISCUSSES DANISH PASTRY IN THE APPENDIX, BUT THE APPENDIX IS NOT DATED, SO ITS EVIDENCE IS INCONCLUSIVE.

The book is by Paul Richards and was published by Hotel Monthly Press (Chicago). Paul Richards wrote many books on food, but almost all are missing from the NYPL. This edition is 1907, but the appendix is undated and contains one date of '1908' in it.

Page 169, APPENDIX
'DANISH PASTRY AND BUTTER CREAMS
'Danish pastry is made of rich coffee cake dough, which was formerly known as yeast raised puff paste, ore as French, or Vienna coffee cake doughs. Of late years the pastry has become more widely known and made popular by the name of Danish pastry, and the methods of slow working doughs have been changed to more progressive methods, using a larger quantity of yeast, which permits the doughs to be made and the butter to be rolled in at once…'

[1](B. Popik): 'Klitteng's book is not on OCLC and perhaps never appeared; the ad merely says 'now in preparation' Also, since Klitteng was widely (if inaccurately) reputed to have invented 'Danish Pastry,' it is surprising that his name does not appear in the *New York Times*.

## KLITTENG BAKED DELICACIES AT WOODROW WILSON'S WHITE-HOUSE WEDDING, 1915, AND THEREBY HELPED POPULARIZE 'DANISH PASTRY'

*Bakers' Helper* (June 1, 1920, p. 1090, col. 1; title; 'Danish Pastry School Starts July 1st) says:

'The school has been founded by L. C. Klitteng, who came to this country from Denmark in December, 1915, and has been responsible for most of the popularity which Danish pastry has acquired here. Shortly after his arrival he made his choice dainties for the President's wedding.'

And Vehling (1950: 266), clearly in reference to Klitteng, despite not mentioning his name specifically and despite inaccurately saying he came from Copenhagen, writes: 'He baked the wedding cake for President Wilson's wedding in Washington.'

We may safely assume that Klitteng's baking for the wedding provided a major boost for his reputation and his Danish pastry.

## HERMANN GERTNER INTRODUCED DANISH PASTRY TO NEW YORK CITY OR PERHAPS ONLY POPULARIZED IT THERE. BUT HE APPARENTLY LEARNED OF DANISH PASTRY FROM KLITTENG.

First, here is the 1927 item mentioning Gertner, presented already above:
7 April 1927, *The Restaurateur*, p. 8, col. 1:
'*Introduced Danish Pastry to New York*
*Herman Gertner Is the Man Who More Than Any Other*
*Is Responsible for the Great Vogue of Pastry in America.'*
(...)

'The genesis of his growth is that 'every man deserves a chance.." This led to his discovery of the chef who introduced Mr. Gertner to Danish pastry and which led to Gertner's introducing Danish pastry to Broadway, New York, and permanent stock engagements in the West.'

Of course, the chef/baker who introduced Gertner to Danish pastry must have been L. C. Klitteng, who went to work for Gertner right after his baking gig for Woodrow Wilson's 1920 wedding. See also the above 1946 *NY Herald Tribune* article by Clementine Paddleford (p. 32).

*NY TIMES* OBITUARY OF GERTNER
(Jan. 23, 1962, p. 33, col. 4)

*'HERMAN GERTNER*
*EX-RESTAURATEUR*
*Retired Owner of Chain on*
*Broadway Dies at 90*

'Herman Gertner, a well-known Broadway restaurateur a generation ago, died at this home, 185 Riverside Drive. He was 90 years old.

'MR. GERTNER HAS OFTEN BEEN GIVEN CREDIT FOR INTRODUCING DANISH PASTRY TO NEW YORK [caps added], and one of his bus boys was Leo Lindy, who later became famous for his own establishment, Lindy's.

'At one time, Mr. Gertner had five restaurants operating along Broadway, between Thirty-eighth and Ninety-seventh Streets. He started in the restaurant business on the lower East Side in 1903 or 1904, his relatives recall, then opened a restaurant in the Broadway Central Hotel before moving uptown.

'At one point during his career Mr. Gertner befriended a Danish baker who convinced him that Danish pastry might be well received in New York. Mr. Gertner began serving the pastry in his restaurant and it immediately was a success.

'Mr. Lindy, who started as a bus boy and later was promoted to waiter, married Mr. Gertner's sister. Mr. Gertner later made Mr. Lindy a manager of one of his Broadway spots. He retired from the business a quarter of a century ago.

'He is survived by his widow, the former Frieda Engel; a son, Philip, of New York; a sister, Mrs. Regina Abend of New York, and a grandchild.'

* * *

(Several photocopies from 1920's *Bakers Weekly*, etc. appear on the following pages.)

# DANISH PASTRY BAKING SCHOOL



INSTRUCTOR L.C.KLITTENG
ORIGINATOR OF DANISH PASTRY IN U.S.A.

DANISH CULINARY STUDIO

OFFICE 146-5TH AVE NEW YORK

## OPENS ON OR ABOUT JUNE 1st

*(Fourteen Days Course Covering 100 Hours)*

New Course 1st and 15th of each month. For Master Bakers, Master Bakers' Sons, Foremen and Bakery Employees generally. No women pupils taken. Enroll now for first course.

When writing please mention BAKERS WEEKLY

L. C. KLITTENG,

Write for terms to
DANISH CULINARY STUDIO
148 Fifth Avenue, New York

April 24, 1920 *Bakers Weekly,* p.17




# *Klitteng's*

# DANISH PASTRY SCHOOL

## New York

**Fourteen Days' Course (100 Hours)**
—WORKING HOURS, 8 A. M. TO 4 P. M.—

## Opens July 1st

For Master Bakers, Master Bakers' Sons, Foremen and Bakery Employees generally. No women pupils taken. New course 1st and 15th of each month. School capacity 12 persons. Conducted by L. C. Klitteng personally. For enrollment in the first course starting July 1st, write for terms at once to

*L. C. KLITTENG*
*Danish Culinary Studio*
146 Fifth Avenue New York, N. Y.

When writing please mention Bakers' Helper

June 1, 1920 *Bakers' Helper*, p. 1090

# Danish Pastry

## *The Last Word in Fancy Cakes for the Coming Winter Season*

# Learn It Now---and Learn It Right

THE name of L. C. Klitteng is known all over the United States in combination with his work as instructor in making Danish Pastry. It will therefore, we suppose, be of great interest to see and read some of the indorsements which Mr. Klitteng has received from prominent men of the trade, testifying to the success of his methods and how his Danish Pastry has brought large profits.

## What They Say

Below will be found extracts of letters from those who have tried Danish Pastry as a commercial product. These are but a few of the many testimonials on file in our office:

*"An artist"*

I am glad to state that the price I paid Mr. Klitteng for his recipes he well earned. He is an artist in his line, and the American public will appreciate his mode of baking. It was a great surprise to my patrons when they first tasted the Pastry, but it was something they were looking for, and Mr. Klitteng deserves my heartiest recommendation to anyone who may require his services.

GERTNER'S, New York.

*"A revelation to us"*

The articles produced and the methods employed in the making of these confections were a revelation to us. We are now producing the Danish Pastries daily to our entire satisfaction and the great pleasure of our customers, who are delighted with them. Our compensation is real.

BUSY BEE COMPANY, St. Louis.

*"Both Mrs. Wilson and the President pleased"*

We had the pleasure of serving Danish Pastries made here by you at the wedding reception of the President of the United States on December 18, 1915. Both Mrs. Wilson and the President tasted your Pastry and were pleased with same. We also sent some of these samples to several of our customers, who were delighted with the taste of your Danish Cakes.

RAUSCHER'S, Washington, D. C.

*"Failed to keep up with demand"*

Mr. Klitteng has proved to be a baker of unusual ability, an artist in his special line, his work and instructions, his speed and accuracy are of such a character we never had occasion to see paralleled by anyone before. The goods turned out by his master hand are the most attractive and the best selling cakes ever put on our counter.

Since Mr. Klitteng has given our bake shop practical instructions and demonstrations we have made Danish Pastry in large quantities every day but have failed entirely to keep up with the demand. It has been a great surprise to our patrons and we do believe firmly that the San Francisco people will gladly pay a little more money in order to have such fine and appetizing cakes on their tables. Mr. Klitteng's venture and mode of baking is an absolute success with the Golden Pheasant and its patrons. His success and reputation are of greatest value to any first-class house.

THE GOLDEN PHEASANT, San Francisco.

*"Sold before it is baked"*

I engaged Mr. L. C. Klitteng, consulting baker of the Isle of Laesoe, Denmark, to instruct my bakers to make genuine Danish Pastry and I am more than pleased with the results. . . . After baking this pastry for nearly a week, the demand is so great that most of it is sold before it is baked.

It has also helped my other business in a considerable degree, just as I had figured would be the case, but that the Danish Pastry should turn out to be such a great success nobody could have imagined but Mr. Klitteng himself, who seems to know this particular kind of business practically as well as technically, in a way that makes him an authority of the very highest rank—in other words, what he says and does goes. There is no doubt whatsoever that his introduction of the baking of Danish Pastry, now is, and in the future will be, of the greatest importance to the baker's trade in the United States.

JOHN SEYBOLD, Miami, Fla.

*"An expert in his line."*

We engaged Mr. Klitteng for the purpose of instructing our bake shop in the making of Danish Pastry. We are very much pleased with the result of this experiment. We find that Mr. Klitteng is an expert in his line, the work and instructions being highly satisfactory. The Danish pastry is very delicious, and all that can be desired. Mr. Klitteng has our hearty approval and support in this work.

HOTEL GRUNEWALD, New Orleans.

Any man of the trade who is interested in the development of high-grade goods should write at once for terms and other particulars regarding Klitteng's Danish Pastry School. Also illustrated booklet sent free, on request. All letters should be addressed:

## *DANISH CULINARY STUDIO*

**146 FIFTH AVE., NEW YORK**

Feb. 27, 1926 *The Restaurateur,* p. 2


*Danish Pastry*
*Some typical forms*

# *Danish Pastry* opens up to you a new field for profitable sales

Naturally you are on the alert for novel dishes to introduce to your diners—for example, new ideas in desserts and baked goods whose deliciousness promises an extensive sale.

Danish Pastry opens up to you a virgin field in which you can cultivate a healthy, profitable business.

As the name implies, Danish Pastry was recently brought to this country from Denmark by native bakers. There it enjoys great popularity.

Already it has proved extremely popular in dining places in two widely separated portions of the United States—the East and the Pacific Coast. There is good reason to believe it should meet with like favor in all other parts of this country.

*High Quality Standard*

will fall into disrepute. The restaurant or hotel man who skimps will ruin his chances in this new field.

In our Experimental Bakery we have developed a Danish Pastry formula and method fully explained in an informative little leaflet we will gladly send free on request.

If you do not operate your own bakery, we suggest seeing your baker about making Danish Pastry for you.




*Make this convincing test*

Many restaurant and hotels that have had unusual success with Danish Pastry use Crisco for rolling in their dough. They find Crisco especially excellent for this work. If you are not using Crisco, we suggest you let us book you for a 50 lb. tin—sufficient for a thorough trial. Try Crisco not only in your Danish Pastry, but in your other baking and for your frying as well. See if you don't agree that Crisco's better results mean bigger, better business for you.

PROCTER & GAMBLE

*Mail Coupon for* FREE *Danish Pastry leaflet*

PROCTER & GAMBLE (Bulk Crisco Dept.)
1126 Gwynne Bldg., Cincinnati, Ohio
Please send me free your booklet on Danish Pastry.

*Name* .....

*Firm Name*

# RESEARCH BAKERY GIVES RECIPE

## Procter & Gamble Company Through Experiments Tell How To Make A Better Danish Pastry

LIVE bakers everywhere are awake to the desirability of introducing novelties which are tasty and promise an extensive sale, especially if the novelty is one that has already been tried out in some other territory and its success proven.

This is the case with Danish Pastry which, as its name implies, was introduced into this country from Denmark, where it enjoys great popularity.

It has already gained a permanent foothold in two widely separated portions of the country, namely the East and the Pacific Coast. There does not seem to be any reason why it should not meet with like favor in all other parts of the country, to the profit of the baker who is alive to his own interests and is ready to arouse the interests of his customers in a very attractive product.

Like all good things it should be made properly and of first class materials or it will fall into disrepute, and the baker will be apt to blame the product instead of his own lack of good judgment.

The following recipe was developed in the Bakery Research Department of the Procter & Gamble Co., and gives an unusually fine pastry if the directions are followed explicitly:

12 oz. sugar
2 oz. salt
8 oz. milk powder
¼ oz. cardamon seed
¾ qt. eggs
1 oz. vanilla
¼ oz. lemon extract
1½ qts. water (variable)
12 oz. yeast
2 lbs. winter wheat flour
5 lbs. spring wheat flour
12 oz. melted Crisco
3 lb. Crisco rolled in.

Scale off in a machine bowl the first 7 ingredients. Cream them well together. Dissolve the yeast in part of the water, adding the remaining water to the mixture. Have the water cold enough so that the dough will be 78 degrees F. This sometimes requires ice water. Add part of the flour to the mix, then the dissolved yeast, then

## SELECTED REFERENCES

ads-l = ads-l@listserv.uga.edu

*DARE* = Dictionary of American Regional English, ed. Frederic Cassidy and Joan Houston Hall. Cambridge, MA: The Belknap Press of Harvard U. Pr., 1985ff.

Davidson, Alan 1999. The Oxford Companion To Food. Oxford U. Pr., p. 242: '...The Danish name for Danish pastries is *Wienerbrød*, "Vienna bread" (the name by which these recipes are known throughout Scandinavia and N. Germany, where they are also popular). The reverse also applies; in Vienna a similar thing is known as *ein Kopenhagener*. However, as Birgit Siesby (1988) has pointed out, the Danish *Wienerbrød*, which must be counted as the "true" Danish pastry,, is very different from the sticky pastry *Kopenhagener* sold in Vienna and from British and American "Danish pastries." They are expected to be very light and crisp, so Danish bakers make them fresh two or three times a day.'

Mariani, John F. 1999. The Encyclopedia of American food & Drink. NY: Lebhar-Friedman. 2nd ed. (First edition, 1983, published by Ticknor & fields; 2nd edition, 1994, published by Hearst Books. The 1999 edition is evidently a reprint of the 1994 edition. The relevant item is:

*'Danish pastry*, (...) Although the pastries may have Danish origins, these flaky buns and roll are more often associated with New York Jewish delicatessens and bakeries. With this meaning the word first appeared in print in in 1928.'

Popik, Barry 2001. Danish Pastry was apparently invented by L.C. Klitteng (originally from Denmark), with the first clear attestations coming from 1920. Comments on Etymology, vol. 30, no. 4 (Jan. 2001), pp. 17-34.

_____2004. 'Danish Pastry.' barrypopik.com website.

Siesby, Birgit 1988. The Turkish Crescent and the Danish Pastry. PPC 30.

PPC = the food history journal Petits Propos Culinaires (in English); published since 1979 by Prospect Books Ltd., London. (http://members.tripod.com/rdeh).

Vehling, Joseph D. 1950. America's Table. Chicago: Hostaids.

# MATERIAL FOR THE STUDY OF *EAT CROW*: THREE VERSIONS OF HUMOROUS STORY AGREE THAT SCOTCH SNUFF MADE THE BOILED CROW PARTICULARLY UNAPPETIZING[1]

Barry Popik

[ed., G. Cohen: Popik has added two versions of the story to the similar one mentioned in *OED2* and *OED3*, with all three being in basic agreement: A cantankerous old 'Rube'-type famer is outwitted by his (presumably urban) boarders and winds up 'eating crow,' made particularly unappetizing by the addition of Scotch snuff. The punch line 'I kin eat a crow, but I'll be darned if I hanker after/arter it' now produces at most a wan smile but was probably hilarious in the 19th century. The punch line guaranteed the retelling of the story, and so *eat crow* is one of numerous words/expressions which owe their origin at least partly to humor.
Also, the phrase 'eating crow' was widely used and explained in the presidential election of 1880, which evidently played a role in its popularization.]

## TREATMENT IN *OED3*

*OED3*, crow, n. #1
**...3. a. In phrases and proverbial sayings, as ... to eat (boiled) crow (U.S. colloq.): to be forced to do something extremely disagreeable and humiliating.**
... [1851 *San Francisco Picayune* 3 Dec. 1/6 I kin eat a crow, but I'll be darned if I hanker after it.]
1872 *Daily News* 31 July Both [are]..in the curious slang of American politics, 'boiled crow' to their adherents.
1877 *Notes & Queries* 5th Ser. **8** 186/1 A newspaper editor, who is obliged..to advocate 'principles' different from those which he supported a short time before, is said to 'eat boiled crow'.
1884 'M. Twain' *Lett.* (1917) II. 443 Warner and Clark are eating their daily crow in the paper.
1885 *Mag. Amer. Hist.* **13** 199 'To eat crow' means to recant, or to humiliate oneself.
1930 'E. Queen' *French Powder Myst.* xxiv. 196 I should merely be making an ass of myself if I accused someone and then had to eat crow.

---

[1]Revised slightly from Cohen & Popik (2006: 119-122). An earlier version appeared in *COE*, Oct. 2003,vol. 33, no. 1, pp. 7-9, which in turn is an expansion of a June 22, 2003 message sent by Popik to ads-l; title: '*Eating Crow* (1850, 1880).'

1970 *New Yorker* 17 Oct. 39/1 I was going to apologize, eat crow, offer to kiss and make up.

## VERSION IN *CHICAGO TRIBUNE*, 1880

I've found notes about *eat crow* in several 1880 newspapers, e.g. *Chicago Tribune*, 8, June 1880, p. 4, col. 5:

'*EATING CROW*

'The politics of "eating crow" is in the application of the original story to people who swallow a disagreeable candidate of their own party rather than vote for the candidate of their opponent. ...The following story explains how that peculiar diet came into vogue.

'The first allusion to "eating crow" was made in the *Knickerbocker Magazine* a little more than a quarter of a century ago. It was a story of a summer boarding-house-keeper on the Hudson and of an indignant patron. Whenever the latter ventured to suggest that the spring chicken was rather tough, or that the roast beef must have been cut from the cow's hoofs, he was directly told that he was entirely "too perticeler," and that the autocrat of the table and the house could eat anything, even a crow. This settled the matter for the time being, but the boarder convinced against his will was of the same opinion, still, at all events, in regard to the quality of the edibles placed before him. So often was the remark, "I kin eat anything; I kin eat a crow," brought down on his devoted head that he finally resolved to try the old man. He went out gunning one day and succeeded in bagging a very fine, fat, old black crow. He went into the kitchen, and by dint of soft words and filthy lucre, induced the cook to allow him to prepare the crow for the table.

'He boiled it nicely, and it wasn't such a bad-looking dish after all. His heart misgave him; the flinty old cuss would eat it after all. The cook was a Scotch woman, and used snuff. He borrowed all she had and sprinkled it liberally over the crow, gave her another simmer, and then taking it on a salver, brought it before his host, saying as he set it down, "Now, my dear sir, you have said a thousand times, if you have said it once, that you can eat crow. Here is one very carefully cooked." It is said the old man turned pale for a moment, but braced himself against the back of his chair, and with "I kin eat crow," he began, cutting a good mouthful. He swallowed it, and then, preparing for a second onslaught, he looked his boarder straight in the eye, while he ejaculated, "I've eaten crow," and took his second portion. He lifted his hands mechanically, as if for a third onslaught, but dropped them quickly over the region of his stomach, and rising hurriedly and unsteadily, retreated for the door, muttering as he went, "but dang me if I hanker after it".'

The American Periodical Series Online doesn't have it in *The Knickerbocker*, but has it here; this version is very close to the 1851 one cited by *OED2* (from *Daily Evening Picayune*, San Francisco, presented above in full.

*Saturday Evening Post* (1839-1885), Philadelphia, Nov. 2, 1850, vol. XXX, iss. 0, Article 15 – No title, page 4.

'CAN YOU EAT CROW? --- Lake Mahopac was so much crowded the past season, or, rather the hotels in its immediate vicinity were, that the farm-houses were filled with visitors. One of the worthy farmers residing there, it appears, was especially worried to death by boreders. – They found fault with his table—this thing was bad and wasn't fit to eat – and at last the old fellow got so tired of trying to please them, that he undertook as the last resource to reason the matter with them.

"Darn it," said old Isaac, one day, "what a fuss you're making. I can eat anything."

"Can you eat crow?" said one of his young boarders.

"Yes, I kin eat crow."

"Bet you a hat," said his guest.

The bet was made, a crow caught and nicely roasted, but before serving up, they contrived to season it with a good dose of Scotch snuff.

Isaac sat down to the crow. He took a good bite, and began to chew away. "Yes," he said, "I kin eat crow (*another bite and awful face,*) I kin eat crow, but I'll be darned if I naker after it." – Isaac bolted.'

## STORY PRESENTED IN THE 1851 REFERENCE CITED BY *OED2*

*OED2* refers to the *San Francisco Picayune* (San Francisco, Cal.), Dec. 3, 1851, p. 1, col. 6:

'EATING A CROW --- A worthy old farmer residing in the vicinity of Lake Mahopack was worried to death last summer by boarders. They found fault with his table, and said he had nothing fit to eat. "Darn it," said Isaac, one day, "wat a fuss you are making. I can eat anything." "Can you eat a crow?" said one of the boarders. "Yes, I kin eat a crow." Bet you a hat," said the guest. The bet was made, the crow was caught and nicely roasted, but, before serving it up, they contrived to season it with a good dose of Scotch snuff. Isaac sat down to the crow, he took a good bite, and began to chew away. "Yes I kin eat a crow! (Another bite and an awful face.') *I kin eat a crow, but I'll be darned if I hanker after it.*'"

## REFERENCES

ads-l = ads-l@listserv.uga.edu (American Dialect Society listserv).
COE = Comments on Etymology.

Cohen, Gerald Leonard and Barry A. Popik 2006. Studies in Slang, vol. 7. Published privately by Gerald Cohen at University of Missouri-Rolla (since renamed Missouri University of Science & Technology)

Popik, Barry 2008. Entry 'eat crow' on my website barrypopik.com: https://www.barrypopik.com/index.php/new_york_city/entry/eat_crow/

# ORIGIN OF *HUSH PUPPIES* (FOOD)

Barry Popik

## (ED., G. COHEN): PRELIMINARY REMARKS

Mariani's *Encyclopedia of American Food and Drink* says:

'*hush puppy*. A dumpling of cornmeal that is deep-fried, especially popular in the south. The term appears in print for the first time about 1915. Although unconfirmed, the common assumption regarding the hush puppy's origin is that it dates from the period of scarcity following the Civil War, when cooks would toss scraps of corn batter to hungry dogs with the words "Hush, puppies!" But the *Morris Dictionary of Word and Phrase Origins* cites a southern reader's account that in the south the aquatic reptile called the salamander was often known as a "water dog" and "water puppy" (also "dwarf waterdog" (*Necturus punctatus*) and "mudpuppy" (*N. Maculosus*), because of its squat, stout legs. These were deep-fried with cornmeal dough and formed into sticks, and so the account goes, they were called "hush puppies" because eating such lowly food was not something a southern wife would want known to her neighbors.

'Hush puppies are the traditional accompaniment to fried catfish.'

## BARRY POPIK FINDS TWO SPECIFIC ACCOUNTS WHICH FLESH OUT THE TRADITIONAL ETYMOLOGY PRESENTED ABOVE IN MARIANI 1999

### VERSION #1: ORIGIN IS IN TALLAHASSEE, FLORIDA: BLACKS PREPARED DELICIOUS CORNPONES AND SAT AROUND TELLING TALL STORIES. IF THE DOGS THERE GAVE A WHINE OF HUNGER, THE PEOPLE THREW THEM ONE OF THE CORNPONES AND SAID 'HUSH PUPPIES.'

From *The Southern Cook Book of Fine Old Recipes* (Culinary Arts Press, P.O. Box 915, Reading PA, 1939), p. 30, col. 1.

'Tallahassee Hush Puppies

'Embedded in the title of this recipe is a most interesting story.

---

[1]Reprinted from *Com. on Et.,* Oct. 2000, vol. 30, no. 1, pp. 7-9, which in turn was based on two messages sent by Popik to ads-l -- Aug. 2 and 6, 2000.

Tallahassee, Florida, that quaint southern capital, would congregate on warm fall evenings for cane grindings. Some of them would feed the sugar cane to a one-mule treadmill while others poured the juice into a large kettle where it was boiled to sugar. After their work was completed, they would gather around an open fire, over which was suspended an iron pot in which fish and corn pones were cooked in fat.

'The negroes were said to have a certain way of making these corn pones which were unusually delicious and appetizing. While the food was sizzling in the pot, the darkies would engage in rather weird conversations, spellbinding each other with "tall" stories of panther and bear hunts. On the outer edge of the circle of light reflected by the fire would sit their hounds, their ears pricked for strange sounds and their noses raised to catch a whiff the savory odor of the frying fish and the pones. If the taking ceased for a moment, a low while of hunger from the dogs would attract the attention of the man, and subconsciously a hand would reach for some of the corn pone which had been placed on a slab of bark to cool. The donor would break off a piece of the pone and toss it to a hungry dog, with the abstract murmur, "Hush, puppy!"

'The effect of this gesture on the hounds was always instantaneous and the negroes attributed the result to the remarkable flavor of what eventually became known as "The Tallahassee Hush Puppy."

[Then: recipe]'

VERSION #2: VERY SIMILAR TO VERSION #1 EXCEPT THE PLACE OF ORIGIN IS NEAR THOMASVILLE, GEORGIA

From *American Cookery*, June/July 1940, p. 40, col. 2:

'QUERY no 6214,-- "Can you possibly tell me what 'hush puppies' are and how the name originated?"

"Hush Puppies [B. Popik: First the recipe is given. Then:]

'The story of the origin of hush puppies is: In a camp near Thomasville, Georgia, where fishermen and hunters congregate, the negro cook made this bread. While the men were eating, and to pacify the hungry dogs, they would throw pieces of bread to them with this admonition: "Hush, puppies."'

## REFERENCES

ads-l = American Dialect Society listserv (ads-l@listserv.uga.edu)

Mariani, John F. 1983. The Encyclopedia of American Food and Drink. NY: Lebhar-Friedman.

Morris, William and Mary 1971. Morris Dictionary of Word and Phrase Origins. NY: Harper.

# 'NAIL JELLY TO THE WALL,' SPOKEN BY THEODORE ROOSEVELT, MUST HAVE BEEN A HILARIOUS DOUBLE-ENTENDRE TO AFRICAN-AMERICANS[1]

Gerald Cohen and Barry Popik

In a Jan. 22, 2003 ads-l message titled 'Roosevelt's Currant Jelly,' Barry Popik wrote:

> 'William Safire ("On Language" column, *NY Times*) discussed "like trying to nail Jell-O to a tree" on 26 January 1986. Joe E. Decker, a history professor of the University of Tampa (FL), wrote a letter on 9 March 1986, mentioning a Roosevelt letter written in 1915. On 6 April 1986, Safire re-addressed the jelly issue, using again the 1915 date.'

Popik then antedated the 1915 attestation by a few years (9 April 1912, *NY Times*, p. 1):

> 'Somebody asked me why I did not get an agreement with Colombia. They might just as well ask me why I do not nail cranberry jelly to the wall. It would not be my fault or the fault of the nail; it would be the fault of the jelly.'

Now, mention of nailing any kind of jelly to a tree must have produced hilarity among the less reverent members of the African-American community and left even the conservative ones wondering. 'Jelly' and 'jelly roll,' unknown to most whites other than as a food, are well known to blacks as also meaning 'female genitalia.'

T. Roosevelt's quote evidently served as the inspiration for the writing of two blues songs (reproduced in Sackheim 1975: 35, 198):

1) 'On the Wall,' by Louise Johnson:

I'm going to show you women
honey, how to cock it on the wall
Now you can snatch it, you can break it, you can
hang it on the wall
Throw it out the window, see if you
can catch it 'fore it fall
I mean, you can
snatch it, you can break it
hang it on the stinkin' wall

[1]Revised slightly from *COE*, March 2004 (vol. 33, #6), pp. 34-35.

Don't throw it out the window, women
'less you catch it 'fore it fall
(Do it a long time, honey)

2) 'Hang it on the Wall,' by Charlie Patton:
Justshakeityoucanbreakityoucanhangitonthe wall
Hollerwhenyoucantchit'foreitfall
Youcanbreakityoucanhangitonthewall
Hollerwhenicatchit'foreitfall

Sweet jelly

MY ROLL

Sweet mama, won't you let it fall

I AIN'T GOT NO BODY NOW

* * *

## REFERENCES

ads-l = ads-l@listserv.uga.edu (American Dialect Society listserv)
COE = Comments on Etymology
Cohen, Gerald 1993. Jam session—coined by Mezz Mezzrow in 1927. Studies in Slang, part 3 (= Forum Anglicum, vol. 20), pp. 129-132. Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang.
_____1997. Sexual terms and metaphors in the blues, part 1. Studies in Slang, part 5 ( = Forum Anglicum, vol. 22, pp. 73-126. – Page 94-95 present the lyrics quoted from Sackheim 1975 pertaining to 'hang it on the wall.'
Forum Anglicum – The volumes mentioned here were edited by Gerald Cohen.
Johnson, Guy 1928. Double meaning in the popular Negro blues. Journal of Abnormal and Social Psychology (1927-28), vol. 22, pp. 12-20.
Sackheim, Eric 1975. The Blues Line: A Collection of Blues Lyrics from Leadbelly to Muddy Waters. NY: Bobbs-Merrill.

# ORIGIN OF THE *MARGARITA* (DRINK) IS GIVEN IN A 1974 ARTICLE BY BRAD COOPER

Barry Popik

Lucero (1994: 3) describes the Oct. 1974 *Texas Monthly* article I have here. From that article, 'The Man Who Invented The Margarita' by Brad Cooper, p. 76, col. 3:

'He [Pancho Morales, who invented the Conga Cooler] remembers when the Margarita came to life.

"Exactly, it was one Fourth of July. That Fourth of July, everybody came to Tommy's Place...well, not everybody, but a lot of people.

[B. Popik: This was July 4, 1942, Tommy's Place On Juarez Avenue, Juarez, Mexico. The Caesar Salad supposedly was born on July 4, 1924. Don't Mexicans invent food & drink on any other day?]

"A lady came in and said, 'Let me have a Magnolia.'

"Well, the bartender, same as cooks and artists...has a lot of pride. We have too much pride to say, 'Well, I'm sorry...I don't know how to make that drink'"

'Morales knew, roughly, that a Magnolia contained cointreau, some lime, and booze. To save face, he faked it and made it with tequila.

"I gave it to her and she says, "Oh, this is not a Magnolia, but it is very good.' And I said, 'Oh, oh, I thought you said Margarita.' You see, daisy, in Spanish is margarita. The reason I called it the Margarita is because I was thinking of the flower margarita, like the magnolia. She liked it. That's how it originated".'

(ED., G. COHEN): FROM THE SAME ARTICLE: IMPORTANCE OF THE MARGARITA FOR THE SALE OF TEQUILA IN THE U.S.

Popik understandably limited himself to the origin of the drink's name but the following passage is also of interest:

'In 1951, only 5449 gallons of tequila were imported from Mexico into the United States. Last year, according to industry sources, more than 2.8 million gallons poured in, with the major market west of the Mississippi. From a two-fisted drink taken straight with various combinations of lemon, lime, and salt standing by, this clear beverage made from the agave, a cactus-like plant, has become the ingredient of cocktails ranging from the Tequila Sunrise to the Guerrilla Sweat.

---

[1]Revised from *Comments on Etymology*, vol. 30, no. 1, p. 10, which in turn was taken from a July 3, 2000 ads-l message of Popik's.

'What made tequila's success, however, was the Margarita, a light, icy drink made with tequila, cointreau, and lime, and drunk from a glass with its lip rimmed in salt. Like sliced bread and toothpaste, the Margarita seems always to have been with us. But not so. The inventor, one of the great bartenders along the border, still lives, only today he drives (yes) a milk truck. …'

## REFERENCES

ads-l = ads-l@listserv.uga.edu (American Dialect Society listserv)

Cooper, Brad 1974. The Man Who Invented The Margarita. Texas Monthly, Oct. 1974; see p. 76. Available online: https://www.texasmonthly.com/articles/the-man-who-invented-the-margarita/

Lucero, Al 1994. Maria's Real Margarita Book: Drinks So Good They Had to Build The Santa Fe Trail. Berkeley, Cal.: Ten Speed Press.

# *SLOW AS MOLASSES* – A TRUNCATED EXPRESSION

Barry Popik

*Slow as molasses* is a well-known expression in English, but I do not find it listed in such standard works as Dalzell & Victor 2006, *DARE*, Green 2005, *HDAS*, or *OED3*. What primarily interests me though is that *slow as molasses* turns out to be a truncated form of *slow as cold molasses, slow as molasses in the winter time, slow as molasses in January*, or variants thereof.

Here are a few sample attestations of the non-truncated version:

July 1854, *North American Review* (MOA--Cornell database), p. 150:
"'Yes," was the drawling reply, "but he is--as--slow--as--cold molasses."'

9 December 1854, *New York Times*, p. 8:
"'Yes; but he is as slow as cold molasses."'

9 April 1870, *Harper's Weekly*, p. 238:
"'You're slow as molasses in the winter time."'

27 April 1889, Harper's Weekly, p. 330:
'Everybody knew he was slower than molasses in January, like those Pennsylvania Dutch.'

## REFERENCES

ads-l = ads-l@listserv.uga.edu (American Dialect Society listserv)
Ammer, Christine 1995. Fruitcakes & Couch Potatoes. – (*slow as molasses* -- not listed)
Dalzell, Tom and Terry Victor 2006. The New Partridge Dictionary of Slang and Unconventional English. London and New York: Routledge.
DARE -- Dictionary of American Regional English. Frederic Cassidy was the first editor. Joan Houston Hall was originally assistant editor and then became editor. Harvard U Pr. 1985ff.
Green, Jonathon 2005. Cassell's Dictionary of Slang. London: Cassell. 2nd (revised) edition.

[1]This item is a slight revision of a *Com. on Et.* item (Oct./Nov. 2008, pp. 3-4), which in turn was revised from a 5 Oct. 2002 message sent by Popik to ads-l.

HDAS = Historical Dictionary of American Slang. Editor: Jonathan E. Lighter. NY: Random House. 1994ff., vol. 1: A-G, vol. 2: H-O. Publication has for some reason stalled.

OED3 = Oxford English Dictionary, 3rd (online) edition.

# 'MOSCOW MULE' (ALCOHOLIC DRINK) – ITS TWO-STAGE DEVELOPMENT (PRE-1947, WITH NO GINGER BEER) AND THEN 1947 ONWARDS, WITH GINGER BEER AND PROMOTED BY SMIRNOFF

Barry Popik

*OED*2 presents 1963 as the earliest attestation for 'Moscow Mule,' but Popik 2001 (based on my ads-l messages of Oct. 2000) drew attention to an earlier one: *Buckeye Tavern*, 'Patrick Murphy's The Barman's Corner,' 11 May 1944, p. 4, col. 2. That 1944 attestation now turns up in *OED*3. I'm unaware of anyone else who researched Moscow mule about the time that I did and believe it's likely (or at least possible) that my work on the term led to the 1944 citation in *OED*3:

1944 *Buckeye Tavern* 11 May 4/2 'Here is the recipe as advertised: *Moscow Mule* 1 oz. vodka, 10 oz. glass and chipped ice, a twist of lemon peel.'

Also, prior to my spotting the 1944 *Buckeye Tavern* attestation, Mariani 1999 had suggested that the drink goes back to 1947, although he did not include a specific citation; he writes:

> 'Moscow mule. A cocktail made from vodka and ginger beer. Its name refers to vodka's Russian heritage and ginger beer's zest, which combine to give the drink the kick of a mule.
>
> 'The drink was created in 1947 by Jack Morgan, owner of a restaurant in West Hollywood, California, called the Cock 'n Bull, together with Jack Martin and Rudy Kunett of Heublein, a spirits distributor then trying to promote Smirnoff vodka. The drink drink helped spur the popularity of vodka drinks in the United States soon afterward. But during the Korean War the cocktail was used as an object of scorn when New York City bartenders marched with banners proclaiming WE CAN DO WITHOUT THE MOSCOW MULE, to which Smirnoff answered that their company had long ago been making the vodka in New England--a perennial stronghold of American patriotism.'

As for the 11 May 1944 *Buckeye Tavern* citation, here is the full passage:

> 'Since the primary purpose of this column is to keep the trade informed of mixtro news in particular and beverage lore in general, we hasten to report that a drink is being promoted in the southwest. It's a brand promotion, but undoubtedly will click since it has a snappy name and its number one ingredient, vodka, is bought more easily in many areas than is gin or whiskey. The drink is

[1]Revised from *Comments on Etymology*, vol. 30, no. 5 (Feb. 2001, pp. 8-10), which in turn was compiled and revised from several ads-l messages, Oct. 28-31, 2000. Unless otherwise indicated (Mike Salovesh) the sender was Popik.

cooler built along Tom Collins lines, and here is the recipe as advertised:

'*MOSCOW MULE*

'1 oz. vodka, 10 oz. glass and chipped ice, a twist of lemon peel. Ginger ale is taboo--just the ounce of vodka chilled with ice and the tang of a lemon peel. An ounce of such a spirit, by the way allowed to stand in a glass of chipped ice too long, would soon be quite dilute and we doubt that its potency would merit the "mule" title. We haven't tasted it, though, so perhaps our deduction is not entirely correct.'

## MIKE SALOVESH: 1944 MOSCOW MULE DIFFERED FROM SMIRNOFF'S LATER (1948) MOSCOW MULE

In reply to my Oct. 2000 ads-l message presenting the 1944 *Buckeye Tavern* attestation, the late Mike Salovesh wrote (10/29/00):

Barry:

'The recipe may very well be right for 1944, but I can attest that the 1948 version was quite different. Smirnoff Vodka ran an advertising campaign touting Moscow Mules in 1948; I believe they owned the copyright on the name. Their recipe called for a generous 1 oz. shot of Smirnoff vodka in a 10 oz. copper mug, chipped ice, ginger beer, and a twist of lemon peel.

'The Smirnoff people made the mugs widely available. They had the words Moscow Mule and a picture of a kicking mule inscribed on their sides. I can date my Moscow Mule mug fairly precisely; it's tied to my acquaintance with the late James Wilson. Jimmy was a bartender at a bar called University Tavern, on 55th Street near the University of Chicago. In November of 1948, Jimmy opened his own bar a block away. I moved when he did. (I was four years away from being a legal drinker, but Jimmy must have figured I had crossed that line, since he had been serving me at UT for more than a year. He never asked me for proof of age.) Soon after Jimmy's official grand opening celebration, his bar became the place to go for U of C students. I was one of the nighttime regulars from the day Jimmy bought the bar, and my Moscow mule mug was regularly kept on a shelf behind the bar. Jimmy would mix me my then favorite drink anytime I walked in the door. Moscow Mules were popular enough, and probably pretentious enough, that Jimmy regularly stocked ginger beer.

'I've still got the mug; it hangs over our kitchen sink, with a collection of other copper mugs I've acquired over the years....'

## SO,...

There is no doubt that the Moscow Mule was popularized by that big vodka company from Connecticut; a 'Moscow Mule' mug appears in the publication

*Beverage Media* (which continued the *Bar & Grill Journal*) in 1951. But as we all know now, the term is attested already in 1944.

## REFERENCES

ads-l = ads-l@listserv.uga.edu (American Dialect Society listserv)

*Buckeye Tavern*, 'Patrick Murphy's The Barman's Corner,' 11 May 1944, p. 4, col. 2.

Mariani, John F. 1999. The Encyclopedia of American Food & Drink. NY: Lebhar-Friedman. 2nd ed. (First edition, 1983, was published by Ticknor & Fields; 2nd edition 1994, published by Hearst Books. The 1999 edition is evidently a reprint of the 1994.

# *OYSTER BAR* AND *OYSTER COCKTAIL*[1]

Barry Popik

## *OYSTER BAR*

*OED*3 says:

**oyster bar** n. (a) U.S. = oyster bank n.; (b) a bar at which oysters are served as food.
1823 J. L. WILLIAMS *Jrnl.* 23 Oct. in *Florida Hist. Q.* (1908) Apr. 44 At 3 p.m. we entered the river at ebb tide and beat among the *oyster bars until evening.
1878 R. L. STEVENSON in *London* 8 June 441/1 They were driven by a sharp fall of sleet into an Oyster Bar.
1925 E. SITWELL *Troy Park* 74 That child is the small wicked ghost Of Metropoles and oyster bars.
1993 *Esquire* July 81 Though the tide was low, she made her way at near full speed among the oyster bars, circling in off the sandy point..and grinding her right up onto the beach.

## ANTEDATING *OED3:* 1878 TO 1856

The examples below are for *oyster bar* in the meaning 'bar at which oysters are served for food;' earliest one in *OED3*: 1878. The 1823 attestation for *oyster bars* in *OED3* isn't relevant for this, being synonymous with *oyster bank.*

12 September 1856, New York (NY) *Herald*, p. 3, col. 1 classified ad:
M. WRAY, AUCTIONEER.—SALOON FIXTURES, &c., at auction, at 258 Canal street (old number), corner of Greenwich, on Saturday, Sept. 13, at 10 1/2 o'clock, comprising liquor and oyster bar, decanters, chairs, tables, stove, cooking utensils, gas fixtures and lease; also one soda water fountain, in good order.

6 September 1857, New York (NY) *Herald*, p. 7, col. 2 classified ad:
A RESTAURANT, WITH BAR, OYSTER BAR AND stock, for sale, situated down town, doing a profitable business.

---

[1]Compiled and revised from Popik 2008a and 2008b. New information is presented here, but the two 1928 accounts about the origin of *oyster bar* and *oyster cocktail* require supporting information. Folk etymologies are rampant in food terminology, and the two 1928 accounts below were written well after the events they describe.

19 February 1860, New York (NY) *Herald*, p. 3 ad:
At a considerable expense he had fitted up an oyster bar, so that persons who may prefer it can partake of them raw.
(A supper for the Independence Guard at the Academy of Music—B. Popik)

28 April 1869, New York (NY) *Herald*, p. 16, col. 5 classified ad:
FOR SALE—MIRRORS, BAR AND BAR FIXTURES, Eating Counter and Oyster Bar, strictly first class; now in No. 2 Irving place.
A. P. SMITH & BRO., 1,804 Broadway.

## MORE CITATIONS OF *OYSTER BAR*

27 May 1888, New York (NY) *Times*, "An old friend in a new house," p. 5:
It is divided on the ground floor just as the old restaurant in THE TIMES Building was. On the east are the lunch counter, the oyster bar, and the other bar.

2 May 1914, New York (NY) *Times*, p. 4:
MANY SAY GOOD-BYE
TO THE GRAND UNION
*Managers Discover There Are*
*No Keys to Doors to be Closed*
*Finally To-night.*
FAMOUS BLACKBOARD GONE
*Guests No Longer Invited to Chalk*
*Down Sentiments—Oldest Employee*
*a Bellboy of 72.*
Anybody who supposed Simeon Ford was going to hang about the Grand Union yesterday spinning some of those reminiscences for which he was famous was disappointed. True, it was the last day except one in the history of the hotel, but things went on pretty much as usual, except toward afternoon something like sadness seemed to pervade the famous oyster bar.

Frank Sullivan, who presides over that region, and who has been shucking oysters and opening clams on the same spot for twenty-three years, said as many oysters as usual had been caught on the bar at noon time, and kept methodically sticking his knife into the backs of soft-shell clams and placing his victims uncovered on plates. He was sharing the general regret that the house had to shut down, although he mentioned that yesterday was the last day of the oyster season anyhow.

The oyster bar was thronged at lunch time, just as it has been every day for many a year, and in that informal sort of cafe-restaurant, where the fathers and

grandfathers of many up-State folk and New Englanders have made their first acquaintance with metropolitan fare, and where you sit on a backless stool, a S. R. O. sign would not have been out of place. In the adjoining room something like a million and a quarter oysters have been in the habit of annually paying tribute to the appetite of man, and during the last automobile show, when so many visitors were here who were not in the habit of getting fresh oysters at home, the output and intake at the oyster bar ran up to 10,000 a day.

Some are going to miss their Little Neck clams after to-day. According to Sullivan, there are many New York men who have formed the clam habit to the entire exclusion of oysters. If you once get the clam habit, according to Sullivan, you can't shake it off, and mere oyster flavor will not satisfy. Every working day of the twelve months the clam devotees have been dropping in for their raw clams. Sullivan almost sighed as he wondered where these faithful patrons of his dexterity would now have their clams opened.

4 June 1922, Syracuse (NY) *Herald*, "Covering New York with the Herald Man" by Ed Allen, p. 12, col. 1:
His [Simeon Ford, owner of the Grand Union Hotel— B. Popik] investigation told him that the one thing New York had for them and not to be obtained back home was oysters, hence his oyster bar and the bill of fare which told in suggestive lines the many glories of the bivalve. Quality and medium prices did the rest and Mr. Ford became wealthy.

27 September 1925, New York (NY) *Times*, "Forty-Second Street Surveys 100 Years" by James C. Young, pg. SM7:
His [Commodore Vanderbilt—B. Popik] plans reached fulfillment in 1871, when the terminus of the New York & Harlem Railroad was opened for traffic, an event of high importance in the rail history of the country.

After the opening of this terminal the neighborhood progressed as never before. Upon the opposite corner of Park Avenue the Grand Union Hotel, with its celebrated oyster bar, became an institution.

9 June 1928, *The Restaurateur and the American Hotelier*, p. 17, col. 1-2:
Derouet [Leony C. Derouet, Hotel Commodore chef—B. Popik] is said to have been the originator of the "oystar (sic) bar" idea, establishing what is thought to have been the first of its kind at the old Grand Union Hotel.

*Champagne Days of San Francisco*
by Evelyn Wells
(Forward by Lucius Beebe)
New York, NY: D. Appleton-Century Co.
1939
Opposite Pg. 179, Photo Caption:
Gobey's
"Ladies and Gents Oyster Parlor." Home of the Oyster Cocktail.

*OYSTER COCKTAIL*

From *The Restaurateur And The American Hotelier*, 26 May 1928, p. 4, col. 3:
'*The Origin of the Oyster Cocktail*

'The oyster cocktail originated in San Francisco about 1866. One day in one of those rustic restaurants, gold diggers' rendezvous on the Barbary Coast, a husky miner was welcomed as a rude guest to the rude joint. He ordered an old-fashioned whisky cocktail and a plate of California raw.

'After drinking the whisky cocktail this hungry guest without more ado placed the little California raw oysters in the same glass with some tomato catsup, Worcester and pepper sauce and promptly disposed of the appetizing repast.

'The restaurant keeper looked on with great astonishment, then asked "What do you call it?" And the miner, with grand gusto, replied: "Oyster cocktail." Next day without delay the keeper wrote on the bar mirror: "Oyster cocktail. Four bits per glass!"

'In a few days every joint on the Barbary Coast began to serve oyster cocktails. Then gradually the best hotels and cafes in San Francisco got the idea and there appeared on their menus not only oyster cocktails, but different kinds of seafood cocktails as well.'

*OED*3 has 1895 for the first attestation of 'oyster cocktail':
1895 I. K. FUNK et al. *Standard Dict. Eng. Lang.*, *Oyster cocktail.
c1938 *Fortnum & Mason Catal.* 53/1 Oyster Cocktailper bot. 1/9.
1975 M. ORR *Rich Girl, Poor Girl* (1977) xii. 147 The meal..began with an oyster cocktail and progressed to a cold Senegalese soup.

REFERENCES

ads-l = ads-l@listserv.uga.edu (American Dialect Society listserv).
barrypopik.com – Barry Popik's website. (See below, Popik 2008b).

COE = Comments on Etymology

Mariani, John F. 1999. The Encyclopedia of American Food & Drink. NY: Lebhar-Friedman. --- p. 226: '…A San Francisco miner accidentally created the "oyster cocktail" about 1860 and (by extension the "shrimp cocktail") by dipping the bivalve in ketchup.'

Popik, Barry 2008a. *Oyster bar, oyster cocktail* – two 1928 accounts. COE, vol. 38, #1-2, (Oct./Nov. 2008), pp. 16-17), which in turn came from Popik's Nov. 10, 2000 ads-l message on the two terms.

_____2008b. *Oyster bar*. Dec. 30, 2008 entry on the weblog barrypopik.com

Smith, Andrew F. 2004. The Oxford Encyclopedia of Food and Drink in America. NY: Oxford U. Pr.

# PIE-EATING CONTEST/MATCH – DID IT ORIGINATE IN NEW YORK CITY?[1]

Barry Popik

There appears to be no scholarship on the pie-eating contest, an activity which is (no word-play intended) as American as apple-pie, and so the present item represents an initial treatment on the subject.

'Pie eating contest' has 8,760 Google hits and came before Nathan's "hot dog eating contest." Regional newspapers should be good sources for 'pie eating contest/match.'

The first pie-eating contest is attested in 1884 (Chester, PA). But an 1886 Brooklyn Eagle article mentions the first pie-eating contest in Brooklyn occurring a 'a few years ago' and being called a 'tournament':

> PIE EATING contests are not so popular as the ingenious gentleman who started them hoped they would be. I attended the first pie-eating match of importance held in New York, on Third avenue, a few years ago. It was called a tournament, and a fair sized crowd had collected to see it. Six men and two half grown boys sat in a row on a small stage with their hands behind them and expressions of more or less embarrassment on their faces. ...' --- (Full quote appears below.)

It looks like the pie-eating contests in Brooklyn originated independently of anything similar that might have been occurring elsewhere in the country; the contest in Brooklyn was not yet even specifically called a contest. And the mild embarrassment of the participants would be explainable if they were doing something entirely novel (producing messy faces?) Might Brooklyn have been the starting point of pie-eating contests?

Here now are some early attestations in context:

27 February 1884, *Chester Times* (Chester, PA), p. 3, col. 5:

'*Pie Eaters on the Stage.*

'Another grand entertainment will be given in National Hall this evening by the Kickapoo Indians. The features of the evening will be a grand pie eating match which everybody should see. The admission will be the same as usual , ten cents, and those who want good seats had better come early.'

---

[1]Revised slightly from *Comments on Etymology*, vol. 33, no. 2, Nov. 2003, pp. 3-5, which in turn is revised from my ads-l message, Aug. 10, 2001.

22 October 1885 *Waukesha Freeman* (Waukesha, Wisconsin), p. 5, col. 4:
'Pie-eating Contest—Paul View, 1st; Charlie Lewis, 2nd; Ernest Sweet, 3rd.'

12 June 1886. *Trenton Times* (Trenton, NJ), p. 1, col. 2:
'A summer night festival and pie-eating match are to be held in the Opera House this evening, by Dayton Camp, No. 5.'

22 August 1886, *Brooklyn Daily Eagle*, p. 2:
'PIE EATING contests are not so popular as the ingenious gentleman who started them hoped they would be. I attended the first pie eating match of importance held in New York on Third avenue, a few years ago. It was called a tournament, and a fair sized crowd had collected to see it. Six men and two half grown boys sat in a row on a small stage with their hands behind them and expressions of more or less embarrassment on their faces. A negro was among them.

'He smiled with a futile effort to appear at ease and the revelation in the way of mouth that accompanied the maneuver, made him a prime favorite in the pools at once. The others were asked to smile by the spectators but they did not respond. The conditions were simple; a long board table with eight divisions made by nailing as many sticks across the table at regular intervals was placed in front of the contestants with four apple pies before each man. The one who ate his pies first was to receive the munificent prize of three dollars.

'The others were allowed to keep their pie. When the word was given, the men ducked their heads forward and ravenously attacked the pie. It was not a refined spectacle nor was the match close, for the negro won in a canter. Before the others had got themselves into working shape he had finished and was waiting for more. It took the heart out of the others, and they stopped incontinently and looked on with lowering faces while the champion received his reward.

'I was reminded of all this by meeting the negro in the office of a high railroad official a few days ago. He is stenographer and private secretary to the railroad manager, receiving the very comfortable salary of $30 a week. His master says he's as quick, accurate and industrious as any man in the company, and invariably good natured and polite. The circumstances of the man have changed, but his smile has not. It is as vast and cheerful as ever. He hasn't been spoiled by success either, for I was anxious to see whether I was not right in identifying him with the pie eater, and I leaned over his desk on my way and asked him if he had ever been on the state. "Once," he said, revealing the smile suddenly in all its bewildering ramifications, "and once only. It wasn't a cake walk, but a pie eating match, and (proudly) I won it."'

20 November 1887, *Brooklyn Daily Eagle*, p. 16:

'Arthur Kraft won the sack race, potato race and pie eating match.'

24 March 1889, Brooklyn Daily Eagle, p. 9:

'A GREAT PIE EATING CONTEST

'Mentioning the railroad pie brings to mind the story of a pie eating contest which is recounted by the hero of the affair. He is a gambler hero named Burlingame, but he is best known by the sobriquet of Appetite Bill. Almost every sport in the country knows him, and anyone who has ever seen him at dinner knows how well he deserves his nickname. Bill prides himself upon one gastronomic feat which gave him the championship as pie biter and by which he broke many betters,...'

29 June 1900 *Fort Wayne News* (Fort Wayne, Indiana), p. 4, col. 5:

'In addition to these events there will be a balloon ascension, afternoon and night, band concert afternoon and night, a base ball game, a tug of war, afternoon and night, and a pie-eating contest, and everything can be seen free of charge.'

# THE THIN POTATO CHIP ('SARATOGA POTATOES'), WAS INVENTED BY AN AFRICAN-AMERICAN – MOST LIKELY CATHERINE WICKS; LESS LIKELY HER BROTHER, GEORGE CRUM[1]

Barry Popik

## *OED3*'s ENTRIES FOR'SARATOGA POTATOES' AND 'SARATOGA CHIPS

*OED3* has the following for *Saratoga potatoes*:

'**Saratoga potatoes** n. (also **Saratoga fried potatoes**) *U.S.*

**Etymology:** < *Saratoga Springs*, the name of a summer resort in New York State.

1876 M. N. F. Henderson *Pract. Cooking* 194 Nothing deteriorates more by getting cold or keeping than fried potatoes (with the exception of Saratoga fried potatoes, which are served cold).

1877 *Golden Hours* Apr. 187/2 (*heading*) Saratoga Potatoes.

1911 *Oysterman & Fisherman* Mar. 25/2 Serve with oysters... French-fried or Saratoga potatoes.'

And on a side-note, *OED3* has the following for the related *Saratoga chips*:

'**Saratoga chips** n. thinly-sliced fried potato served cold, potato crisps.

1880 F. M. A. Roe *Army Lett.* (1909) 262 The Saratoga chips were delicate and crisp.

1947 *Reader's Digest* Feb. 95/2 She compromised on..a broiled lobster drenched with butter, Saratoga chips, and a fancy ice cream.

1973 *Daily Colonist* (Victoria, Brit. Columbia) 4 Feb. 24/2 An Indian—an American Indian—was a chef in Saratoga, N.Y., in 1853 when he had an order for French fries—sliced thin. He sliced them too thin and they came out crunchy, and for the next 40 or 50 years, they were known as Saratoga chips.'

## ANTEDATING *OED3*'s EARLIEST ATTESTATION (1876) FOR 'SARATOGA (FRIED) POTATOES.

*OED3* has 1876 and 1877 for 'Saratoga (fried) potatoes.' Here are several earlier mentions:

1) 1869 – Dick & Fitzgerald (publishers), How to Cook Potatoes, Apples, Eggs and Fish, p. 15, says:

---

[1]Revised from Popik 2004, which was compiled primarily from my messages to ads-l: Nov. 3, 2001, Dec. 17, 2001, Feb. 14, 2001, April 22, 2003, April 26, 2003, May 2-3, 2003, July 6, 2003. Material from Popik 2005 is also included in the present revised article.

'SARATOGA POTATOES.

'Peel and shave the potatoes in very thin slices, put them on the ice, or in ice water until they are very cold. Put the frying pan over the fire, and while the butter or dripping is getting hot, drain and dry the sliced potatoes. When the fat begins to bubble, drop the potatoes in enough at a time to cover the bottom of the pan. Season them with salt and pepper, turn them over when drowned, and when done drain them on a hair sieve for a few minutes, dish and serve.'

2) 17 November 1870, *The Cultivator & Country Gentleman*, p. 728, col. 3:
'*Saratoga Potatoes.* - Will you tell me how to cook the so-called "Saratoga" potatoes? A. L. (Slice raw potatoes, as thin and even as possible, into cold water. Fry in very hot lard and plenty of it.)'

24 November 1870, *The Cultivator & Country Gentleman* p. 744, col. 3:
'*Saratoga Potatoes.* - I see an inquiry in your paper in regard to "Saratoga potatoes," or as they are called with us "shaved." A. L. can make them very fast, by using an instrument such as is used to shave smoked beef or cabbage, only have the opening in the plane very fine. Those for shaving potatoes especially are sold at all the hardware stores at Saratoga.
*Rose Hill, N. Y.* JAMES THOMPSON.'

3) 18 October 1873, Stevens Point (WI) *Journal*, p. 1, col. 3:

'And now descend we, at one full swoop, from esthetics to - potatoes.

'Perhaps you know very little about these except their daintiness. You may have driven out from your hotel this summer and returned with a cornucopia of "potatoes *a la* Saratoga," and entertained a kind of dim fancy, if you have thought of it all, that they grow in some such mysterious way; but the original article is no more like their crisp, brown, brittle bits of deliciousness than the original "What is it" is like a civilized, cultivated man. No; the original potato is a dirty, ugly tuber, with its mother earth clinging closely around it, and needs divers and sundry operations before it can be presented to your artistic eyes.

4) 1874: *The Queen of the Kitchen: A Collection of "Old Maryland" Family Receipts for Cooking* --- by Miss Tyson (Philadelphia: T. B. Peterson & Brothers), p. 192:

'*Saratoga Fried Potatoes*

'399. Take nicely peeled Irish potatoes, and cut them in very thin slices; throw them into cold water; ice water is best; let them remain for 1 hour; then take them out, and wipe them perfectly dry. Put a few at a time into boiling lard or beef drippings; stir them all the time to keep them from sticking to each other, or to the skillet. When fried a light brown, take them out and put others in. As you take

them out of the grease, be careful not to take any with them. Put them on a sieve, and keep them near the fire until ready to dish.'

5) 5 August 1875, *The Coshocton* (Ohio) *Age*, p.4, col. 2:

'SARATOGA FRIED POTATOES. - The following is said to be all there is of the cook's secret for producing those world-renowned potatoes served at Moon's Lake House, Saratoga Springs, every summer: Peel good-sized potatoes, and slice them as evenly as possible; drop them into ice water. Have a kettle of lard, as for fried cakes, and very hot. Put a few at a time into a towel, shake them about to dry them, and then drop into the hot lard. Stir them occasionally; and when of a light brown take them out with a skimmer. If properly done they will not be all greasy, but crisp without and mealy within.'

## 1917 OBITUARY OF CATHERINE WICKS, THE LIKELY INVENTOR OF THE THIN POTATO CHIP

My thanks to Mary O'Donnell of Saratoga for looking up the Catherine Wicks obituary and sending me a copy. It is the most current account of her life available and looks reliable. Ms. O'Donnell wrote me (in 2004):

'Barry,

'Went to the SSPL yesterday and found the obituary for Catherine A. Wicks. I'll send you a copy – but here is what it said – Front page *The Saratogian*, Friday, May 18, 1917, "Mrs. Wicks dies at age of 102":

"Catherine A. Wicks, who could in truth remember when 'Broadway was a prairie' died early this morning at her home 6 Union Street, at the advanced age of one hundred and two years, five months and one day. Mrs. Wicks, who was twice married and the mother of a large family, was born in Ballston Spa on December 17, 1814, the daughter of Abraham and Catherine Speck. She was a sister of the late George Speck (Crum), pioneer road house proprietor and cook of Saratoga Lake, who died several years ago, and was herself well known as a cook in the early days of Saratoga Lake's civilized history.

"It was as a cook at Moon's Lake house many years ago that 'Aunt Kate', as she was generally known, conceived the idea of slicing potatoes to a tissue paper thinness and frying them in deep fat, thus being the 'inventor' of Saratoga chips. Before going to the Lake to cook, Mrs. Wicks was for fourteen years the cook at the San Souci hotel in Ballston Spa. She was first married in 1846 and came to Saratoga in 1861. As a centenarian, she came honestly by her long life, her father dying at the age of ninety-nine, while her mother is said to have reached the age of 111.

"Her survivors include seven children [B. Popik: list follows].

"In an interview with a Saratogian reporter more than fifteen years ago, Mrs. Wicks is quoted as saying:

'I can remember when there wasn't any railroad here. The ran stages from Ballston to Saratoga when I came here. In those days all over on that side of Broadway (indicating the east side) was frog pond and all of this side was blow sand.'

Funeral services will be held Sunday afternoon at 2 o'clock..."

Mary

O'Donnell, Mary K. / Skidmore College/Lucy Scribner Library/
North Broadway/Saratoga Springs, NY 12866
modennel@skidmore.edu '

## ABOVE ACCOUNT CASTS DOUBT ON 1853 BEING THE DATE OF THE INVENTION OF THE THIN POTATO CHIP

Mariani (1999: 284) says: 'According to most authorities the thin potato chip was created in 1853 at the Moon's Lake Lodge in Saratoga, New York.'

However, Catherine Wicks' obituary specifies that she moved from her birth-place, Ballston Spa, to Saratoga in 1861, and the 1853 date for the origin of the thin potato chip therefore seems in need of revision. (See for example *OED3*'s 1973 attestation for *Saratoga chips.*)

## *WASHINGTON POST* OBITUARY OF CATHERINE WICKS ALSO CREDITS HER WITH INVENTING THE THIN POTATO CHIP

*The Washington Post* (1877-1954), Washington, D. C., May 19, 1917, p. 8:

'*SARATOGA CHIP INVENTOR DIES.*

*'Colored Woman Reputed to Have Been 103 Years Old.*

'Saratoga Springs, N. Y., May 18. – Catherine A. Wicks, colored, the oldest woman in Saratoga County, died today. She would have been 103 years old next December. She was the inventor of Saratoga potato chips and was a sister of the late George Crum, who was famous 50 years ago as a roadhouse proprietor at Saratoga Lake.'

## BRITTEN 1959 SAYS GEORGE CRUM (BROTHER OF CATHERINE WICKS) WAS THE INVENTOR

Evelyn Barret Britten's *Chronicles of Saratoga* (1969, p. 176) attributes the invention to (George) Speck, whose last name was changed to Crum. Speck/Crum

was Catherine Wick's brother, and so whoever gets credit for the invention, the credit remains within the family. But since the detailed 1917 obituary of Catherine Wicks (plus the one in the *Washington Post*) specifically credits Catherine with the invention, where is the evidence that trumps this seemingly authoritative account?

In any case, here is the relevant passage in Britten's book:

'Crum was a native of Malta, the son of Abraham Speck, a jockey, who had come from Kentucky in the early days of Saratoga Springs and married an Indian girl. The inventor of potato chips was christened Crum by none other than the original Commodore Cornelius Vanderbilt, founder of the Vanderbilt fortunes in America, who, visiting Moon's with a party of guests, had had to wait a long time to be served, and finally had requested an attendant to ask "Crum," "How long before we shall eat?"

'It was the commodore's confusion of ideas—"Crumb" and "speck" – that gave the famed Indian guide the name he carried through the rest of his life.'

## REFERENCES

ads-l = ads-l@listserv.uga.edu (American Dialect Society listserv)

barrypopik.com – April 17, 2005 entry: 'Saratoga potatoes'

Britten, Evelyn Barret 1959. Chronicles of Saratoga. Saratoga. published by the author.

Dick & Fitzgerald (publishers) 1869. How to Cook Potatoes, Apples, Eggs and Fish. NY.

Fox, William S. and Mae G. Banner 1983. Social and economic contexts of folklore variants; The case of potato chip legends. In: Western Folklore, May 1983, 42.114-126.

Mariani, John F. 1999. American Food & Drink. NY: Lebhar-Friedman, p. 284: 'Saratoga potatoes. Also, "Saratoga chips." Thinly sliced deep-fried potatoes. "Potato chips" have been known since the 1840s, but they were sliced fairly thick in those days. According to most authorities the thin potato chip was created in 1853 at the Moon's Lake Lodge in Saratoga, New York (another story places it at the Montgomery Hall Hotel in the same town), when chef George Crum supposedly sliced his potatoes as thin as possible to placate the request of a particularly stubborn customer for thinner potatoes. (Legend has it that the customer was transportation tycoon Cornelius Vanderbilt, whose great-great-grandson's wife Marylou Whitney, went so far as to write *The Potato Chip Cookbook.*) The next day the chips were given out free in paper cones to customers, and a sign was put on the bar reading HELP YOURSELF. They became very popular across the country (especially after automatic potato-peelers were introduced in 1925), and after a while the term "potato chip"

meant a very thin, fried potato, usually served cold as a snack and most often purchased at a food store, usually from a large barrel or display case. (In England French-fried potatoes are called "potato chips," a usage first referred to in a letter of Oscar Wilde, date March 1876.)...'

*New York Times* – does not mention Catherine Wicks.

Popik, Barry 2004. The thin potato chip ('Saratoga potatoes') was invented by an African-American—most likely Catherine Wicks...; Comments on Etymology, vol. 33, #6 (March 2004), pp. 27-33.

_____2005. (See above: barrypopik.com)

Saratoga County Historical Society, housed in the Brookside Museum http://www.brooksidemuseum.org/george-crum-and-the-potato-chip-2/ The item says:

'...George Crum (a.k.a. "Speck")...is credited with "inventing" the potato chip while a cook at Moon's Lake House on Saratoga Lake in 1853. Local legend has it that a disgruntled customer at Moon's sent back his fried potatoes suggesting that they were not crisp enough. Crum apparently did not take criticism well and shaved the potato paper thin, fried them, and the rest is history.

'A similar story explains that Kate Wicks, who also worked at Moon's, accidentally dropped a chip of potato into the hot fat, and Crum fished it out and tasted it.

'George Speck and Kate Speck Wicks were born to Abraham and Catherine Speck. George also used the name Crum, as his father did while a jockey. Most stories say that George spent his youth as a guide in the Adirondacks, but by 1853 was working for Cary Moon at Moon's Lake House. In 1860 George purchased a building on Malta Avenue near Saratoga Lake, and within a few years was catering to wealthy clients including William Vanderbilt, Cornelius Vanderbilt, Jay Gould, and Henry Hilton. His restaurant closed around 1890 and he died in 1914 at the age of 92.

'Whether George was the actual inventor of the potato chip is debatable. He never took credit for the invention of the potato chip, and as he was hardly a humble man, he undoubtedly would have claimed it as his own if it were so. Additionally, potato chips were not on the menu at his own restaurant. Further research indicated that George's sister, Kate Speck Wicks, has the stronger claim.

'An interesting variant of the dissatisfied customer story seems to have been created in the 1970s by a potato chip industry support organization, which claimed the dissatisfied customer was none other than Cornelius Vanderbilt. This claim has been widely disproved.

'Sources consulted: William S. Fox and Mae G. Banner. "Social and Economic Contexts of Folklore Variants: The Case of Potato Chip Legends." *Western Folklore* May 1983: 42:114-126.'

Tyson (Miss; first name: ?) 1874. The Queen of the Kitchen: A Collection of 'Old Maryland' Family Recipes for Cooking. Philadelphia: T. B. Peterson & Brothers.

# ORIGIN OF *THOUSAND ISLAND DRESSING*

Barry Popik

## TREATMENT IN MARIANI'S *ENCYCLOPEDIA*...

This is from John Mariani's *Encyclopedia of American Food & Drink: Thousand Island dressing*: A salad dressing based on Russian dressing with varied additions of pickles, cream, green peppers, and other seasonings. The term dates in print to 1920 [Popik: Actually 1913; see next paragraph], probably derived from the Thousand Islands in the St. Lawrence River that cuts between New York and Ontario, where the dressing may have first been concocted. But Craig Claiborne in *Craig Claiborne's Southern Cooking* (1987) wrote:

> 'Legend has it that it was created many years ago by the executive chef at the Drake Hotel in Chicago...and when his wife saw it she remarked that it looked like the Thousand Islands, near Ontario, New York, that they had recently visited.'

Incidentally, for earlier attestations than 1920, cf. 'Thousand Island Salad Dressing' (*American Cookery*, May 1913, p. 710, col. 2, and Asparagus with Thousand Island Dressing' (*American Cookery*, May 1919, p. 748, col. 2).

1. ACCOUNT IN 1925 *CHEF DE CUISINE*: THOUSAND ISLAND DRESSING IS INVENTED BY CHEF THEO. ROOMS AT THE BLACKSTONE HOTEL (CHICAGO) AND CALLED *BLACKSTONE DRESSING*; ROOMS VACATIONS AT THE THOUSAND ISLANDS, WHILE THE MAITRE D' RECEIVES INQUIRIES ABOUT THE DELICIOUS NEW DRESSING; UPON ROOMS' RETURN THE MAITRE D' (AUWAERTER) HITS UPON A NEW NAME: *THOUSAND ISLAND DRESSING*.

From *Chef De Cuisine* (Sept. 26, 1925; 'Published in connection with the opening of the new grand ball room Hotel Sherman and Inaugural Dinner Dance of the Chefs of Cuisine Association of Chicago'), p. 47.

> '*THE ORIGIN OF THOUSAND ISLAND DRESSING*
> By THEO. ROOMS

---

[1]Reprinted from *Comments on Etymology*, Oct. 2000, no. 1, pp. 4-6, which in turn was taken primarily from Popik's July 9, 2000 ads-l message.

Chef de Cuisine, Drake Hotel

Mr. Theo. Rooms, Chef at the Drake Hotel, is the original founder of this most delicious salad-dressing.

It is known from coast to coast and is found on every bill of fare.

It's [sic] ingredients consist of:

Mayonaise
Chili Sauce
Pimentos
Green Pepper Chives

To create new combinations of foodstuffs requires knowledge, theoretical and Practical, of the composition of food in general. Credit is, therefore, due to all those who give these subjects special attention.

It is more and more recognized that the human system needs a well balanced diet. Vegetables and salads form a prominent part in building up and sustaining the human structure.

To add spice and to make these particular foods more palatable has been the aim of many chefs; with the result that various dressings have been compounded.

The circumstances leading to the discovery of the now famous 1000 Island Dressing is being told by Mr. Rooms in the following manner:

Whenever a great Hotel or Restaurant is being opened, it is customary to have some new dishes as a specialty with their appropriate names appearing on the Bill of Fare.

So it was when fifteen years ago the exclusive Blackstone Hotel opened it's [sic] doors to the public.

Many new dishes were created and appeared on the bill.

Mr. Rooms was then chef de gardemanger at the Blackstone and his contribution consisted of a new Salad Dressing.

It found immediate favor with the hotel patrons and was in big demand. In honor of the Hotel it was called Blackstone dressing. Chefs and Stewards of other Hotels heard of the dressing and inquiries came from all directions asking particulars and information.

At this particular time, Mr. Rooms went on a vacation on the St. Lawrence River visiting the Thousand Islands.

Coming back home, he discussed with the Maitre d'hotel, Mr. Auwaerter, the success of the dressing, and in the course of conversation, the visit to the Thousand Islands was mentioned.

A sudden thought then struck Mr. Auwaerter, and he exclaimed excitedly: "1,000 Island Dressing is a good name for your new Salad Dressing."

From that moment on, the Salad Dressing that now delights a multitude of diners has been known as THOUSAND ISLAND DRESSING.'

Chicago, 1910, Blackstone Hotel? Is the Blackstone the same hotel as the Drake, or did Rooms move from the Blackstone to the Drake?

MIKE SALOVESH REPLIES TO POPIK'S QUESTION JUST ABOVE

[ed., G. Cohen: The late Mike Salovesh sent the following July 10, 2000 message to ads-l]:

'...The Blackstone, on South Michigan Avenue, is opposite Grant Park near the Art Institute. It opened in 1910. The Drake's address, on East Walton Place, slightly disguises the fact that its west wall is found on North Michigan Avenue, roughly a couple of miles north of the Blackstone. The Drake's entrance faces the North Avenue Beach.

'...the Drake opened in 1920... Both hotels [Drake, Blackstone] remained open and in competition with each other, [and] Chef Rooms...did move from the Blackstone to the Drake.'

REFERENCES

ads-l = ads-l@listserv.uga.edu (American Dialect Society listserv).

Mariani, John F. 1999. The Encyclopedia of American Food & Drink. NY: Lebhar-Friedman. 2nd ed. (first ed. 1983, published by Ticknor & Fields; 2nd edition appeared 1994, published by Hearst Books. The 1999 edition is evidently a reprint of the 1994 edition.

# 1905 *ATLANTA CONSTITUTION* ARTICLE ON ICE CREAM CONE: ORIGINATED AT THE ST. LOUIS WORLD'S FAIR AND WAS NOW VERY POPULAR AT THE GEORGIA STATE FAIR[1]

Sam Clements
sclements@neo.rr.com

[ed., G. Cohen: Clements sent the first of the items below in an Aug. 11, 2003 ads-l message. Barry Popik had mentioned in an earlier ads-l message that he had a 1905 attestation and would send it later, but that message turned out to be the same as the 8/11/2003 one which Clements had posted. Clements later added three more early attestations.]

From Ancestry.com, *Atlanta Constitution*, Oct. 20, 1905:

'CORNUCOPIA WAFFLES

'They Are Attracting Much Attention at the Georgia State Fair.

'One of the most attractive exhibits at the fair, and especially which aroused the interest of the visitors, is that of the Cornucopia Waffle Oven Company of St. Louis, Mo. This company is introducing a new novelty for serving Ice Cream, Marmalades, Charlotte Russe, Fruits and other delicacies without the use of dishes or spoons. It is a Cornucopia or Cone shape crisp cake, made of the choicest flour, sugar, baked crisp and brown in especially constructed Waffle Ovens. These Cone Waffles are filled with Ice Cream or other delicacies desired, are eaten with the contents and consequently there remains no waste, no spoons, dishes nor napkins to clean.

'They were first introduced at the great world's fair at St. Louis and immediately, on account of its daintiness and neatness, became the most popular confection and have proven equally so this season in the east and especially at the parks at Coney Island, Atlantic City, Chicago and various other famous resorts. There is no doubt this will be the favorite manner of serving Ices, Salads and other confections to guests at picnics and social functions. This company has a large bakery at St. Louis, where the demands of Cornucopia are supplied; they also manufacture and have on sale the Ovens and Irons for those desiring to do their own baking.'

---

[1]Reprinted from *Comments on Etymology*, Nov. 2003, vol. 33, no. 2, pp. 9-13.

'Note too a contemporary account in 1904. From Ancestry.com, Washington Post (DC), Sept. 4, 1904, p. 5, col. 3, in a Sunday article on the Fair; [title]:

'NEW DAINTIES TO EAT

'One of the latest innovations which is extremely popular is the idea of selling ice cream encased in a funnel-shaped waffle of delicious taste. The novelty of the idea, the delicacy of the article, all add to the popularity of this combination of ice cream and cake.'

'Finally, here are two other early attestations:

*Gettysburg Compiler*, August 30, 1905: 'S.A. Troxel has concession for selling ice cream cones at Williams Grove.'

*Steven Point Journal* (Wisconsin newspaper), Oct. 6, 1906: 'John Stuart and Vernon Allen ran an ice cream cone stand at the Wautoma fair and made a great success of the venture.'

REFERENCES

ads-l – ads-l@listserv.uga.edu (American Dialect Society listserv).

Baker, John 2011, Nov. 6, 2001 ads-l message: 'There seems to be broad agreement on web sites (for what that may be worth) that the ice cream cone was independently reinvented and popularized at the St. Louis Exposition in 1914, although Hamwi is only the most prominent of several claimants for the credit.

'The OED takes "ice cream cone" back only to 1920.

'I quote now from a 1908 book referring to events of 1906 (R. Haas Electric & Manufacturing Co. v. Springfield Amusement Park Col. 236 III. 452, 456, 86 N.E. 248, 250 (1908). – He occasionally repeats himself on the items he enumerates):

"Herman Armbruster, who superintended the electrical construction for the electric company…testifies that the work was done during June and July, 1906…'We put the sign on two buildings, refreshment stands, pagodas, sign on the main stand, dancing pavilion, bridge, theater (interior and exterior), porch around the old building, additional lights in the kitchen and rear porch on the rear building, penny arcade, shooting gallery, bowling alley and pool, rough house, house of trouble, fun factory, cave of the winds, roller coaster, photograph gallery, Japanese bowling alley, THREE ICE CREAM CONE STANDS [S. Clements: my caps.], throwing-the-ring stand, knock-the-baby-down stand, the outhouses, wiring for 14 arcs in and around the park, putting

up buffet sign on porch around old building, theater sign on theater, signs on the penny arcades, shooting gallery, bowling alley, house of trouble fun factory, etc.'"'

Mariani, John F. 1999. American Food and Drink. NY: Lebhar-Friedman. – No mention of 'cone' or 'ice cream cone.'

Popik, Barry 2001a. Nov. 6, 2001 ads-l message: 'This was slightly bizarre day for the New York Herald Tribune food experts, with two contradictory items on the same food.

1) 29 July 1954, p. 10, col. 1:
'Waffle Man's Inspiration: Ice Cream Cone is 50; Born at St. Louis Fair – by Clementine Paddleford'
'The ice cream industry is celebrating the fiftieth birthday of the ice cream cone this week. The industry's version of the origin of the cone says that it was born in an emergency at St. Louis' World's Fair (the Louisiana Purchase Exposition) on one of the hottest days of a hot summer in 1904. The cone was the invention of a Syrian penny-sugar-waffle concessionaire who quickly wrapped a waffle from his iron and handed it to his next-door neighbor the ice cream vendor, whose dishes had run short for serving the popular 10-cent frozen deliciousness.
'E.A. Hamwi was the name of the genius inventor who put ice cream on the road in a portable container. …'
2) From the same NYHT, 29 July 1954, p. 12, col. 5:
'Patented a Machine in 1903; Italo Marchiony Dies, 86; Ice Cream Pioneer --- Special to the Herald Tribune
'CLIFFSIDE PARK, N.J., July 28. – Italo Marchiony, eighty-six, retired ice cream cone and candy manufacturer who is believed to the be the originator of the ice cream cone, die yesterday at his home, 232 Adolphus Ave.
'Histories of the ice cream cone, including the records of the International Association of Ice Cream Manufacturers, say that the ice cream cone was originated at the St. Louis World's Fair in 1904 as the inspiration of Ernest A. Hamwi, a native of Damascus, Syria. Mr. Hamwi, who operated a stand at the fair selling wafe-like pastry called Zalabia, reportedly came to the aid of a nearby ice cream vender who had run out of dishes. He offered his wafer rolled in the shape of a cornucopia as a substitute and thus, allegedly, the ice cream cone was born.
'Patented in 1903
'Members of Mr. Marchiony's family contended today that he hit upon the idea of the ice cream cone in 1896, later patented a cone-making machine and also developed the ice cream waffle or ice cream sandwich. [col. 6] The United States Patent Office in Washington confirmed that Mr. Marchiony had patented on December 13, 1903—six months before the St. Louis

World's Fair opened -- "A mold for making ice cream cups and the like." 'The mold was described as "split in two like a waffle iron and producing several small round pastry cups with sloping sides."

'Born in Pieve di Cadore in the northern Italian province of Belluno, he established a cone and candy manufacturing business in Hoboken, N.J. at 221-227 Grand St. He closed down the business and retired in 1938. He moved to Cliffside Park two years ago. ...'

_____2001b. Nov. 7, 2001 ads-l message: There was an editorial in the New York Herald Tribune, 30 July 1954, p. 12, col. 2: 'The Ice-Cream Cone Saga' – just a re-hash of the July 29th article. Also, Two letters in 'Ice-Cream Cone Notes,' NYHT, 4 August 1954, p. 9, col. 7:

171 Version.

To the N. Y. Herald Tribune:

'I would like to offer some history regarding the ice-cream cone editorial I read in your paper.

'In my family is an iron on which a cone was baked in the year 1761 with the initials of the family in the imprint on the iron, "I. N. W."

This iron operates by two handles which are decorated differently. When brought together they bake a flat cake about six to four inches, which must be turned into the cone by hand when it is still hot. Each side of the iron is engraved or decorated having the date 1761 on one side and the initials "I. N. W." on the other.

'The dough for baking these cones is especially prepared and left to set for four or five hours before baking, and each cone may be turned to show either the date or the name.

'It requires two people to bake them—one to operate the iron and one to fold the cake while hot into a cone shape.

'The name of this cone was originally called "brislet" and owned by a family in Alsace-Lorraine named Wieland. It was handed down from 1761 and is now in possession of a family on St. Louis, Mo. by that name. The idea of the ice-cream cone came from this originally, though the brislet was filled with whipped cream. So the ice-cream cone is really much more that fifty years old.

MRS. F. H. WIELANDY,

Greenwich, Conn. Aug. 1, 1954.'

_____2003. Aug. 11, 2003 ads-l message: "I searched [Ancestry.com] for "ice ream" and "inventor":

1) 4 Dec. 1931, Zanesville Signal (Zanesville, Ohio), p. 1, col. 7:
'INVENTOR OF ICE CREAM CONE DEAD
'Acron, O., Dec. 4. – The inventor of the ice cream cone is dead.

He was Charles E. Menches, 72, circus trapeze performer, concessionaire, theater operator, creator of novelties. Menches suffered a heart attack at his home here and died last night.

'The carnival man, who had watched many of the noisy efforts of human beings to find pleasure, sat in his concession at the St. Louis world's fair, glancing idly about.

'Two girls in a nearby ice-cream stand had wrapped waffles around ice cream and were eating with gusto.

'Menches sprang from his chair with a shout of conviction and ice cream cone virtually was created. He founded the first cone company in 1905.'

2) 5. Dec. 1931, *Indiana Evening Gazette* (Indiana, Pennsylvania), p. 3, col. 5: 'INVENTOR OF ICE CREAM CONE DEAD

'AKRON, O., Dec. 5 – UP – Charles E. Menches, 72, who invented the ice cream cone and thereby created an American institution, died here on Thursday night.

'He was a circus trapeze performer, a concessionaire, theatre operator and creator of novelties.

'Death followed a heart attack.'

3) 16 Aug. 1935, *Helena Independent* (Helena, Montana), p. 1, col. 4: 'ICE CREAM CONE INVENTOR DUY PUNISHED FOR CRIME

Bozeman, Aug. 15 – (AP – Walter McLaren of Cooke City, gold mine operator and reputedly the originator of the ice cream cone, paid a fine of $350 in justice court here after he pleaded guilty to driving an automobile while he was intoxicated.'

4) 2 Aug. 1941, *Helena Independent* (Helena, Montana), p. 5, col. 2: '...Walter McLaren of the McLaren Gold Mines company, Cooke City and the M. & M. Mining company of Radersburg. Mr. McLaren achieved world fame as the inventor of the ice cream cone.'

5) 22 Aug. 1945, *Independent-Record* (Helena, Montana), p. 2: 'Funeral Services Are Conducted For Mining Man—Walter McLaren Was Widely Engaged Over This State'

'...He became an inventor and in 1912 hit upon the ice cream cone gadget that still is employed by some of the biscuit companies.'

6) 1 May 1943, *Charleston Daily Mail* (Charleston, West Virgin1a), p. 4, col. 4: 'Ernest A. Hamwi, who claimed to be the inventor of the ice cream cone, died recently in St. Louis.'

# HERRING VIEWED BY THE IRISH AS A PROSAIC FOOD

George Thompson[1]
and
Gerald Cohen
with valuable input from the Irish Studies Group
(irishstudies@lists.services.wisc.edu)

In a 5/14/2003 message to the American Dialect Society titled '"Herring broth" as an ethnic slur?', George Thompson presented an incident recorded in *Commercial Advertiser*, August 18, 1807, pp. 2/3, 3/1:

> 'John Middleton was indicted for an assault on Mary Gibson. The prosecutrix is a married woman of reputation, a native of Ireland. On Sunday the 2d. inst. the prisoner came into her apartment, where she and her husband were at breakfast, and enquired if she could not give him some *herring-broth*. Conceiving this to be a gross national as well as personal insult, the prosecutrix threw the contents of the slop-bowl in his face, and he departed to all appearance perfectly satisfied. He was relating this treatment to a friend of his, on the stoop of a house in Broadway as Mrs. Gibson was returning from church. His friend perceiving her pass by, pointed her out to him, when he followed her in the street, telling her at the same time that he was giving her a little herring-broth. The prisoner made no defence at the bar. The jury found him guilty, and the court very deservedly sentenced him to six months imprisonment in the city prison.'

Thompson then commented:

> 'Is this a traditional reflection on the poverty of Ireland? I believe that herrings have in English anyway a reputation as a poor sort of food. No doubt "herring-broth" would be a thin sort of broth. I've never encountered the expression, though Ms. Gibson seems to have understood it readily.'

A few months later I asked the expert on Irish matters at my campus (John Morgan, English Dept.) about this. He told me that when he was a child, if he or one of his siblings asked their mother what was for dinner, the standard answer they received was 'Tea, bread and herring.' In other words, 'Don't bother me, you'll see what's for dinner at dinnertime.'

---

[1]George Thompson, now retired, was formerly a librarian at Bobst Library, New York University. The present article is slightly revised from *Comments on Etymology*, vol. 33, no. 2, Nov. 2003, pp. 6-8.

Herring was regarded as a very prosaic food. The request for 'herring broth' was no doubt an allusion to the poverty of the Irish (hence the furious reaction), although this was probably not a traditional taunt.

John Morgan notified the Irish Studies discussion group about the 1807 'herring-broth' incident and soon received several insightful replies:

1) From Carmel McCaffrey (cmc@jhu.edu): 'Actually, as a native Irish person I know that broth was always the food of poor people who just boiled or simmered bones and the like into a broth. In Dublin there is an expression to describe the eating habits of the poor: ""your dinner's poured out".'

2) from Jim MacKillop (pmackillop@yahoo.com): '..."herring choker" is an archaic insult for my own ethnic group, the Scottish Gaels (mostly Catholic, former Jacobites) of Nova Scotia [G. Cohen: See clarification in item #3]. It has been so ameliorated that the abbreviated form, "herron," is now a term of rough affection. More significantly, when my father migrated to Boston ca. 1923, "herring choker" was a term of derision used by Boston Irish, who considered themselves a cut above, for the New World Gaels of Nova Scotia.

'In other contexts, "herring choker" has also denoted poor Scandinavians.'

3) correction and clarification from Jim MacKillop:

'On closer examination, "herring choker" appears to apply to all Maritimers, not just Scottish Gaels. It is indeed a term of derision, but one that has lost its bite.

'The basis of the insult is that the herring was thought such an unsuitable fish—almost impossible to bone—that only the poor would eat it. In earlier times it was used primarily as bait for more desirable catches.

4) from Catherine Shannon (CBS38@aol.com): 'Re: herring issue – I too, born and bred near Boston, recall the use of the term "herring choker" to denote those who came down to the area from the Canadian Maritimes. Jim is correct that the implication was that they weren't quite as Irish as we were who had parents and grandparents who came directly from Ireland to Boston. There was also another term suggesting a bit of smug superiority over those "Irish" who came from the Maritimes---they were referred to as "two boaters." Does anyone else recall that usage?

'Mackerel snapper was a term of derision that applied rather broadly among the lower echelons of WASP Boston to all the local RC's. Too bad our television age and pc'ness has made our language less graphic and imaginative in some respects.'

[G. Cohen: In the last paragraph, Catherine Shannon is replying to Jim Doan's e-mail: 'I'm just guessing, but could it be comparable to calling someone a

"mackerel snapper," one of the few anti-Catholic terms of derision I remember from my youth? In other words, he [of the 1807 article) made an immediate assumption that the couple were Irish, therefore Catholic (and fish-eating), as well as presumably of a lower socioeconomic level than the individual who entered the apartment.' --- John Morgan then added: "I do know that herring and mackerel are the fish ordinaire in Ireland.']

5) from Philip E. Cleary (Philip.cleary@verizon.net), Oct. 4, 2003 ads-l message responding to Catherine Shannon's item just above, which I shared with ads-l:

'I don't, strictly speaking, recall the usage of "two boaters," but I do remember that my Boston born and bred father (himself the grandson of a two boater) once told me about the expression. I don't remember if he said it was used in his youth (early 20th c.) or if he was referring to the usage of a prior generation.'

6) from Judy Brodhead (jabrodhead@noctrl.edu): 'How about a different fish-kenning insult, "mackerel-snapper"? It means a Catholic (eating fish on Fridays) but I never heard it until I was 18.'

## REFERENCES

ads-l = ads-l@listserv.uga.edu (American Dialect Society listserv)

DARE = Dictionary of American Regional English -- editor in chief: Frederic Cassidy, and upon his death, Joan Houston Hall. 1985ff. Belknap Pr. of Harvard U. Pr.

Skelly, Joseph 1876. The Charge of the Hash Brigade. This is a comic Irish sketch, of interest generally for its humor about unsavory food. E.g., p. 4 mentions everything that went into the hash: (1) corned beef left from last Sunday, (2) Monday's turnips, (3) Friday's 'herrin's', (4) the cranberry pie that Flaherty left on his plate, (5) a suspender (should have been cut up small). --- (with later editions).